#### **NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

#### MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

# OF THE 38<sup>TH</sup> SITTING OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF THE FIRST SESSION (2012-2013) OF THE TENTH PARLIAMENT OF GUYANA HELD AT 2.00 P.M.

# ON THURSDAY, 14<sup>TH</sup> FEBRUARY, 2013 IN THE PARLIAMENT CHAMBER, PUBLIC BUILDINGS,

#### BRICKDAM, GEORGETOWN.

#### MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (68)

#### Speaker (1)

The Hon Raphael G.C. Trotman, M.P., Speaker of the National Assembly

#### **MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNMENT (34)**

#### (i) People's Progressive Party/Civic (34)

Hon. Samuel A.A. Hinds, O.E., M.P., Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs

Hon. Clement J. Rohee, M.P., Minister of Home Affairs

Hon. Dr. Leslie S. Ramsammy, M.P., Minister of Agriculture (Absent – on leave)

Hon. Mohabir A. Nandlall, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica), Attorney General and Minister of Legal Affairs

Hon. Carolyn Rodrigues-Birkett, M.P. (Region No. 9 – Upper Takutu/Upper Essequibo), Minister of Foreign Affairs

Hon. Dr. Ashni K. Singh, M.P., Minister of Finance

Hon. Robert M. Persaud, M.P. (Region No. 6 – East Berbice/Corentyne),

Minister of Natural Resources and Environment

Hon. Dr. Jennifer Westford, M.P. (Region No. 7 – Cuyuni/Mazaruni),

Minister of the Public Service

Hon. Dr. Bheri S. Ramsarran, M.P., Minister of Health

Hon. Mohamed I. Alli, M.P., Minister of Housing and Water

Hon. Dr. Frank C.S. Anthony, M.P., Minister of Culture, Youth and Sport

Hon. Brindley H.R. Benn, M.P., Minister of Public Works

Hon. Priya D. Manickchand, M.P. (Region No. 5 – Mahaica/Berbice), Minister of Education (Absent – on leave)

Hon. Ganga Persaud, M.P., Minister of Local Government and Regional Development

Hon. Jennifer I.M. Webster, M.P., Minister of Human Services and Social Security

Hon. Pauline Campbell-Sukhai, M.P., Minister of Amerindian Affairs

\*Hon. Dr. Nanda K. Gopaul, M.P., Minister of Labour

Hon. Alli Baksh, M.P. (Region No. 2 – Pomeroon/Supernaam), Minister in the Ministry of Agriculture

Hon. Norman A. Whittaker, J.P., M.P. (Region No. 1 – Barima/Waini), Minister in the Ministry of Local Government and Regional Development

Hon. Bishop Juan A. Edghill, M.S., J.P., M.P., Minister in the Ministry of Finance

Ms Gail Teixeira, M.P., Government Chief Whip

Mr. Manzoor Nadir, M.P.

Mrs. Indranie Chandarpal, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica) (Absent – on leave)

Bibi S. Shaddick, M.P. (Region No. 3 – Essequibo Islands/West Demerara)

#### \*Non-Elected Minister

Mr. Komal Chand, C.C.H., J.P., M.P. (Region No. 3 – Essequibo Islands/ West Demerara)

Mr. Odinga Lumumba, M.P.

Mr. Neendkumar, J.P., M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mr. Dharamkumar Seeraj, M.P. (Absent)

Dr. Vishwa D.B. Mahadeo, M.P.

Rev. Dr. Kwame A. Gilbert, M.P.

\*\*Mr. Joseph Hamilton, M.P., Parliamentary Secretary in the Ministry of Health

Dr. Vindhya Vasini Persaud, M.S., M.P.

Mr. Cornel Damon, M.P. (Region No. 2 – Pomeroon/Supernaam)

Mr. Faizal M. Jafarally, M.P. (Region No. 6 – East Berbice/Corentyne)

#### Members of the Opposition (33)

#### (ii) Members of A Partnership for National Unity(26)

Brigadier (Ret'd) David A. Granger, M.S.S., M.P., Leader of the Opposition

Dr. Rupert Roopnarine, M.P.

Ms Amna Ally, M.P., Opposition Chief Whip

Mr. Basil Williams, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mrs. Volda Lawrence, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Dr. George Norton, M.P.

Mrs. Deborah Backer, M.P., Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly

#### \*\*Non-Elected Member

Mr. Carl B. Greenidge, M.P.

Lieutenant Colonel (Ret'd) Joseph F. Harmon, M.S.M., M.P.

Mr. Keith Scott, M.P.

Ms Dawn Hastings, M.P. (Region No. 7 – Cuyuni/Mazaruni)

Mr. Winston Felix, D.S.M., M.P.

Ms Jennifer J. Wade, M.P. (Region No. 5 – Mahaica/Berbice)

Mr. Sydney Allicock, M.S., M.P.

Ms Africo Selman, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mr. Desmond Trotman, M.P.

Ms Vanessa Kissoon, M.P. (Region No. 10 – Upper Demerara/Upper Berbice)

Mr. James A. Bond, M.P.

Mr. Ronald A. Bulkhan, M.P.

Mr. Jaipaul Sharma, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mrs. Mabel Baveghems, M.P.

Mr. John Adams, M.P. (Region No. 3 – Essequibo Islands/West Demerara)

Mr. Christopher A. Jones, M.P.

Mr. Richard Allen, M.P. (Region No. 1 – Barima/Waini)

Mr. Renis Morian, M.P. (Region No. 10 – Upper Demerara/Upper Berbice)

Miss Annette N. Ferguson, M.P.

#### (iii) Members of The Alliance For Change (7)

Mr. Khemraj Ramjattan, M.P.

Mr. Moses Nagamootoo, J.P., M.P.

Mrs. Catherine Hughes, M.P.

Mrs. Valerie Garrido-Lowe, M.P.

Dr. Veersammy Ramayya, M.P. (Region No. 6 – East Berbice/Corentyne)

Ms June Eula Marcello, M.P. (Region No. 8 – Potaro/Siparuni)

Mr. Trevor Williams, M.P.

#### **OFFICERS**

Mr. Sherlock E. Isaacs, Clerk of the National Assembly

Mrs. Lilawtie Coonjah, Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly

#### **COMMENCEMENT OF SITTING**

The Sitting commenced at 2.26 p.m. with Mrs. Deborah Backer M.P., Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly in the Chair.

#### **PRAYERS**

The Clerk read the prayers.

#### **ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE SPEAKER**

In the absence of the Speaker of the National Assembly, the Deputy Speaker did not allow the Minister of Home Affairs to present the following Bills:

#### **INTRODUCTION OF BILLS-**

#### **Presentation and First Readings**

#### 1. EVIDENCE (AMENDMENT) BILL 2013 – Bill No. 7/2013

The Minister of Home Affairs, on behalf of the Government to present the following Bill:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Evidence Act.

## 2. MOTOR VEHICLES AND ROAD TRAFFIC (AMENDMENT) BILL 2013 – Bill No. 8/2013

The Minister of Home Affairs, on behalf of the Government to present the following Bill

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic Act.

#### **PUBLIC BUSINESS**

#### (i) GOVERNMENT'S BUSINESS

#### **BILLS - Second Readings**

## ITEM 1 - CUSTOMS (AMENDMENT) BILL 2013 - Bill No. 2/2013 published on 2013-01-08

At the request of the Minister of Finance the second reading of the following Bill was <u>deferred</u>:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Customs Act.

(Read a first time on 2013-01-10)

### ITEM 2 - TELECOMMUNICATIONS BILL 2012 - Bill No. 18/2012 published on 2012-08-09

At the request of the Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs the second reading of the following Bill was <u>deferred</u>:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to provide for the establishment of the Telecommunications Agency and for a regular, coordinated, open and competitive telecommunications sector and for matters incidental thereto or connected therewith.

(Read a first time on 2012-08-09)

### <u>ITEM 3</u> - <u>PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2012 – Bill No.</u> <u>17/2012 published on 2012-08-09</u>

At the request of the Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs the second reading of the following Bill was <u>deferred</u>:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Public Utilities Commission Act.

(Read a first time on 2012-08-09)

## ITEM 4 - FIREARMS (AMENDMENT) BILL 2012 - Bill No. 21/2012 published on 2012-09-04

The Minister of Home Affairs to move the second reading of the following Bill:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Firearms Act.

(Read a first time on 2012-10-22)

#### (ii) PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS

#### **MOTION**

# ITEM 5 - THE APPOINTMENT OF A COMMISSION OF INQUIRY TO INVESTIGATE THE INCIDENCE OF CRIMINAL VIOLENCE FROM 2004 TO 2010 IN GUYANA

At the request of Brig. (Ret'd) David Granger, M.S.S., M.P., Leader of the Opposition, consideration of following motion was <u>deferred</u>:

WHEREAS, Article 138(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of Guyana prescribes that no person shall be deprived of his life intentionally save in the execution of the sentence of a court in respect of an offence under the Laws of Guyana of which he has been convicted;

AND WHEREAS in accordance with the Commission of Inquiry Act, Chapter 19:03, "The President may issue a commission appointing one or more commissioners and authorizing such commissioner or commissioners to inquire into any matter in which an inquiry would, in the opinion of the President, be for the public welfare";

AND WHEREAS this country has witnessed a pattern of unlawful killing of undetermined numbers of persons – including assassinations; executions; murders; extra-judicial killings by members of the Guyana Police Force Target Special Squad and other forms of criminal violence in Guyana during a period of 'troubles' on the East Coast and East Bank of Demerara and elsewhere – which were harmful to the public welfare;

AND WHEREAS several of these killings have been of a deliberate and systematic nature – particularly those which occurred at Agricola; Bartica; Buxton; Eccles; Lindo Creek; Lusignan and Bel Air, Bourda and Kitty in Georgetown – which can be classified as massacres and have engendered alarm and despondency among the population;

AND WHEREAS some killings involved members of the Guyana Police Force, the Guyana Defence Force and unidentified criminal gangs in which gangsters were equipped with a variety of electronic 'eavesdropping' equipment, weapons and vehicles that were provided with assistance and support by members of the Guyana Police Force;

AND WHEREAS commissions of inquiry and coroners' inquests have not been conducted into some unnatural deaths and criminal investigation reports by the Guyana Police Force, with regard to the most egregious of these crimes, have often been inconclusive;

AND WHEREAS the National Assembly is the supreme legislative forum of our Republic wherein the people's elected representatives discuss and determine matters of national interest and which is obliged to consider the grave threats to the public welfare and public security which prevailed during the aforesaid period of the 'troubles' and which remain substantially uninvestigated,

#### BE IT RESOLVED:

That the National Assembly condemns the killing of citizens of Guyana which occurred during the period of the 'troubles' and expresses its concern that commissions of inquiry have not been convened to investigate the unlawful killings, including the assassination of a Minister of the Government in April, 2006, on the East Coast of Demerara:

#### BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED:

That the National Assembly calls upon the President of Guyana, in accordance with the Commission of Inquiry Act, Chapter 19:03, to appoint a Commission of Inquiry to inquire into the unlawful killing of citizens during the years 2004 to 2010.

(Notice Paper No. 112 (M47 Opp 29) published on 2012-12-12)

#### BILLS – Second Readings

### <u>ITEM 6</u> - <u>THE CONSTITUTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2013 – Bill No. 4 of 2013</u> published on 2013-02-08

Mr. Carl B. Greenidge, M.P., moved the second reading of the following Bill:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Constitution of Guyana in accordance with Article 164 of the Constitution of Guyana.

(Read a first time on 2013-02-07)

The following Members spoke to the motion:

Bibi Shaddick

Mr. Basil Williams

Mr. Khemraj Ramjattan

#### **SUSPENSION OF SITTING**

At 3.45 p.m., the sitting was suspended for refreshments.

#### **RESUMPTION OF SITTING**

At 5.12 p.m., the sitting resumed with the Speaker in the Chair.

The Assembly resumed the debate on the Constitution (Amendment) Bill 2013.

The Attorney General and Minister of Legal Affairs also spoke to the motion.

Thereafter, Mr. Carl Greenidge, M.P., replied.

### The Bill was read a second time on the following division:

<u>FOR</u>	<b>AGAINST</b>
Mr. T. Williams	Mr. Jafarally
Ms Marcello	Mr. Damon
Dr. Ramayya	Dr. Persaud
Mrs. Garrido-Lowe	Rev. Gilbert
Mrs. Hughes	Dr. Mahadeo
Mr. Nagamootoo	Mr. Neendkumar
Mr. Ramjattan	Mr. Lumumba
Ms Ferguson	Mr. Chand
Mr. Morian	Ms Shaddick
Mr. Allen	Mr. Nadir
Mr. Jones	Ms Teixeira
Mr. Adams	Bishop Edghill
Ms Baveghems	Mr. Whittaker
Mr. Sharma	Mr. Baksh
Mr. Bulkan	Mrs. Campbell-Sukhai
Mr. Bond	Ms Webster
Ms Kissoon	Mr. G. Persaud
Mr. Trotman	Mr. Benn
Ms Selman	Dr. Anthony
Mr. Allicock	Mr. Ali
Ms Wade	Dr. Ramsarran
Mr. Felix	Dr. Westford
Ms Hastings	Mr. R. Persaud
Mr. Scott	Dr. Singh
Lt. Col. (Ret'd) Harmon	Mrs. Rodrigues-Birkett

Mr. Greenidge	Mr. Nandlall
Mrs. Backer	Mr. Rohee
Dr. Norton	Mr. Hinds
Mrs. Lawrence	
Mr. B. Williams	
Ms Ally	
Dr. Roopnarine	
Brig. (Ret'd) Granger	
33	28

The Assembly resolved itself into Committee to consider the Bill clause by clause.

### **In Committee**

<u>Clause 1</u> was <u>passed</u> as <u>printed</u> on the following division:

<u>FOR</u>	<u>AGAINST</u>
Mr. T. Williams	Mr. Jafarally
Ms Marcello	Mr. Damon
Dr. Ramayya	Dr. Persaud
Mrs. Garrido-Lowe	Rev. Gilbert
Mrs. Hughes	Dr. Mahadeo
Mr. Nagamootoo	Mr. Neendkumar
Mr. Ramjattan	Mr. Lumumba
Ms Ferguson	Mr. Chand
Mr. Morian	Ms Shaddick

Mr. Allen	Mr. Nadir		
Mr. Jones	Ms Teixeira		
Mr. Adams	Bishop Edghill		
Ms Baveghems	Mr. Whittaker		
Mr. Sharma	Mr. Baksh		
Mr. Bulkan	Mrs. Campbell-Sukhai		
Mr. Bond	Ms Webster		
Ms Kissoon	Mr. G. Persaud		
Mr. Trotman	Mr. Benn		
Ms Selman	Dr. Anthony		
Mr. Allicock	Mr. Ali		
Ms Wade	Dr. Ramsarran		
Mr. Felix	Dr. Westford		
Ms Hastings	Mr. R. Persaud		
Mr. Scott	Dr. Singh		
Lt. Col. (Ret'd) Harmon	Mrs. Rodrigues-Birkett		
Mr. Greenidge	Mr. Nandlall		
Mrs. Backer	Mr. Rohee		
Dr. Norton	Mr. Hinds		
Mrs. Lawrence			
Mr. B. Williams			
Ms Ally			
Dr. Roopnarine			
Brig. (Ret'd) Granger			
33	28		

#### **Assembly resumed**

On a motion by Mr. Carl B. Greenidge, M.P., the Constitution (Amendment) Bill 2013 was read a third time and <u>passed</u> as <u>printed</u> on the following division:

<u>FOR</u>	<b>AGAINST</b>
Mr. T. Williams	Mr. Jafarally
Ms Marcello	Mr. Damon
Dr. Ramayya	Dr. Persaud
Mrs. Garrido-Lowe	Rev. Gilbert
Mrs. Hughes	Dr. Mahadeo
Mr. Nagamootoo	Mr. Neendkumar
Mr. Ramjattan	Mr. Lumumba
Ms Ferguson	Mr. Chand
Mr. Morian	Ms Shaddick
Mr. Allen	Mr. Nadir
Mr. Jones	Ms Teixeira
Mr. Adams	Bishop Edghill
Ms Baveghems	Mr. Whittaker
Mr. Sharma	Mr. Baksh
Mr. Bulkan	Mrs. Campbell-Sukhai
Mr. Bond	Ms Webster
Ms Kissoon	Mr. G. Persaud
Mr. Trotman	Mr. Benn
Ms Selman	Dr. Anthony
Mr. Allicock	Mr. Ali
Ms Wade	Dr. Ramsarran

Mr. Felix	Dr. Westford
Ms Hastings	Mr. R. Persaud
Mr. Scott	Dr. Singh
Lt. Col. (Ret'd) Harmon	Mrs. Rodrigues-Birkett
Mr. Greenidge	Mr. Nandlall
Mrs. Backer	Mr. Rohee
Dr. Norton	Mr. Hinds
Mrs. Lawrence	
Mr. B. Williams	
Ms Ally	
Dr. Roopnarine	
Brig. (Ret'd) Granger	
33	28

# <u>ITEM 7 - THE FISCAL MANAGEMENT AND ACCOUNTABILITY (AMENDMENT)</u> <u>BILL 2013 - Bill No. 5 of 2013 published on 2013-02-08</u>

Mr. Carl B. Greenidge, M.P., moved the second reading of the following Bill:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Fiscal Management and Accountability Act 2003.

(Read a first time on 2013-02-07)

#### **SUSPENSON OF SITTING**

At 6.55 p.m., the sitting was suspended for refreshments.

#### **RESUMPTION OF SITTING**

At 7.47 p.m., the sitting was resumed.

The Assembly resumed the debate on the Fiscal Management and Accountability (Amendment) Bill 2013.

The following Members spoke to the motion:

Mr. Manzoor Nadir

Mr. Jaipaul Sharma

The Minister in the Ministry of Finance

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

At 8.47 p.m., due to grave disorder by some Members, the Speaker of the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 47(9), adjourned the sitting to a date to be fixed.

HON. RAPHAEL G.C. TROTMAN, M.P., Speaker of the National Assembly

PARLIAMENT OFFICE,
Public Buildings,
Brickdam,
Georgetown.

14th February, 2013.