

# National Assembly Debates

**PROCEEDINGS AND DEBATES OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF THE FIRST SESSION (2006-2008) OF THE NINTH PARLIAMENT OF GUYANA UNDER THE CONSTITUTION OF THE CO-OPERATIVE REPUBLIC OF GUYANA HELD IN THE PARLIAMENT CHAMBER, PUBLIC BUILDINGS, BRICKDAM, GEORGETOWN Part I of II**

---

47<sup>th</sup> Sitting

14:00h

Thursday, 6 March 2008

---

## **MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (70)**

### ***Speaker (1)***

#### **The Hon Hari N Ramkarran SC, MP**

*Speaker of the National Assembly*

#### **Members of the Government (42)**

#### **People's Progressive Party/Civic (41)**

#### **The United Force (1)**

The Hon Samuel A A Hinds MP

*(R# 10 - U Demerara/U Berbice)*

*Prime Minister and Minister of*

*Public Works and Communications (Absent – performing the functions of Office of President)*

The Hon Clement J Rohee MP (AOL)

*Minister of Home Affairs*

The Hon Shaik K Z Baksh MP

*Minister of Education*

The Hon Dr Henry B Jeffrey MP (AOL)

*Minister of Foreign Trade and International Cooperation*

The Hon Dr Leslie S Ramsammy MP

*(R# 6 - E Berbice/Corentyne)*

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

*Minister of Health*

The Hon Carolyn Rodrigues-Birkett MP

*(R# 9 - U Takutu/U Essequibo)*

*Minister of Amerindian Affairs*

\*The Hon Dr Ashni Singh MP

*(AOL)*

*Minister of Finance*

The Hon S Rudolph Insanally, OR, CCH, MP *(AOL)*

*Minister of Foreign Affairs*

The Hon Harry Narine Nawbatt MP

*Minister of Housing and Water*

The Hon Robert M Persaud MP

*(AOL)*

*(R# 6 - E Berbice/Corentyne)*

*Minister of Agriculture*

The Hon Dr Jennifer R A Westford MP

*(R#7 - Cuyuni/Mazaruni)*

*Minister of the Public Service*

The Hon Kellawan Lall MP

*Minister of Local Government and Regional Development*

\*The Hon Doodnauth Singh SC, MP

*(Absent)*

*Attorney General and Minister of Legal Affairs*

The Hon Dr Frank C S Anthony MP

*Minister of Culture, Youth and Sport*

The Hon B H Robeson Benn MP

*Minister of Transport and Hydraulics*

\*\*The Hon Manzoor Nadir MP

*Minister of Labour*

The Hon Priya D Manickchand MP

*(R# 5 - Mahaica/Berbice)*

*Minister of Human Services and Social Security*

The Hon Dr Desrey Fox MP

*Minister in the Ministry of Education*

The Hon Bheri S Ramsaran MD, MP

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

*Minister in the Ministry of Health*

\*Non-elected Minister \*\*Elected Member from TUF

The Hon Jennifer I Webster MP

*Minister in the Ministry of Finance*

The Hon Manniram Prashad MP

*Minister of Tourism, Industry and Commerce*

\*The Hon Pauline R Sukhai MP

*Parliamentary Secretary in the Ministry of Tourism,  
Industry and Commerce*

Mr Donald Ramotar MP

Ms Gail Teixeira MP

Mr Harripersaud Nokta MP

Mrs Indranie Chandarpal MP, Chief Whip

Ms Bibi S Shadick MP

*(R# 3 – Essequibo Is/W Demerara)*

Mr Mohamed Irfaan Ali MP

Mr Albert Atkinson JP, MP

*(R# 8 - Potaro/Siparuni)*

Mr Komal Chand CCH, JP, MP

*(R# 3 - Essequibo Is/W Demerara)*

Mr Bernard C DeSantos SC, MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

Mrs Shirley V Edwards JP, MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

Mr Mohamed F Khan JP, MP

*(R# 2 - Pomeroon/Supenaam)*

Mr Odinga N Lumumba MP

- (AOL)

Mr Moses V Nagamootoo JP, MP

Mr Mohabir A Nandlall MP

Mr Neendkumar JP, MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

\*\*\* Mr Steve P Ninvalle MP

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

*Parliamentary Secretary in the  
Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport*

Mr Parmanand P Persaud JP, MP

*(R# 2 - Pomeroon/Supenaam)*

Mrs Philomena Sahoye-Shury CCH, JP, MP *Parliamentary  
Secretary in the Ministry of Housing and Water*

\*\*\*Non-elected Member

Mr Dharamkumar Seeraj MP

Mr Norman A Whittaker MP

*(R# 1 - Barima/Waini)*

**Members of the Opposition (28)**

**(i) People's National Congress Reform 1-Guyana (22)**

Mr Robert HO Corbin

*Leader of the Opposition*

Mr Winston S Murray CCH, MP

Mrs Clarissa S Riehl MP

*Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly*

Mr E Lance Carberry MP

*Chief Whip*

Mrs. Deborah J. Backer MP

Mr Anthony Vieira

- *(Absent)*

Mr Basil Williams MP

Dr George A Norton MP

Mrs Volda A Lawrence MP

- *(AOL)*

Mr Keith Scott MP

Miss Amna Ally MP

Mr Dave Danny MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

Mr Aubrey C Norton MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Mr Ernest B Elliot MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

Miss Judith David-Blair MP

*(R# 7 - Cuyuni/Mazaruni)*

Mr Mervyn Williams MP

*(Re# 3 - Essequibo Is/W Demerara)*

Ms Africo Selman MP

Dr John Austin MP

*(R# 6 - East Berbice/Corentyne)*

Ms Jennifer Wade MP

*(R# 5 - Mahaica/Berbice)*

Ms Vanessa Kissoon MP

*(R# 10 - U Demerara/U Berbice)*

Mr Desmond Fernandes MP

*(Region No 1 – Barima/Waini)*

Mr James K McAllister MP

- (AOL)

**(ii) Alliance For Change (5)**

Mr Raphael G Trotman MP

Mr Khemraj Ramjattan MP

Mrs Sheila VA Holder MP

- (AOL)

Ms Latchmin B Punalall, MP

*(R# 4 - Demerara/Mahaica)*

Mr David Patterson MP

**(iii) Guyana Action Party/Rise Organise and Rebuild (1)**

Mr Everall N Franklin MP

**OFFICERS**

Mr Sherlock E Isaacs

*Clerk of the National Assembly*

Mrs Lilawatie Coonjah

*Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly*

**FIRST DAY ESTIMATES 2008**

**14:10H**

**PRAYERS**

*[The Clerk reads the Prayers]*

**PUBLIC BUSINESS**

**(1) GOVERNMENT BUSINESS**

**MOTION**

**BUDGET SPEECH 2008 - MOTION FOR THE  
APPROVAL OF THE ESTIMATES OF  
EXPENDITURE FOR 2008**

Assembly resolved itself into committee of supply to consider the Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 2008

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008  
IN COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY**

**The Chairman:** We will proceed in accordance with the Sub-Committee's Resolution and Schedule. Will Members kindly turn to Volume 1 -

Pages 30 and 31 ...

**AGENCY 01 -OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT,  
Programme 011 - Head Office Administration**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$1,387,422,000 for Agency 01 - Office of the President, Programme 011 - stands part of the Estimates

The Honourable Member Mr Winston Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, Accounts Code 6111 - 6115 - Total Wages and Salaries - Could the Honourable Minister provide to the National Assembly the authorised of the personnel in each of those categories?

And in respect of Account Code 6116 - Contracted Employees - Could the Honourable Minister inform this National Assembly as to how many such employees there are; the positions they occupy and their remuneration for each of the positions?

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**The Chairman:** Honourable Member, as you will say that is a bit of a mouthful. There are three questions I figure out there. Let us start with one first. The first one is the strength of the positions of Account Codes 6111 to 6115...

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Yes Sir.

**The Chairman:** ... the strength of the authorised positions in each one of those items.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, in response to the question raised by the Honourable Member Mr Murray, the strength for:

- Account Code 6111 - Administrative - five persons
- Account Code 6112 - Senior Technical - no person
- Account Code 6113 - Other Technical and Craft skilled - seven employees
- Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support - twenty-two persons
- Account Code 6115 - Semi-Skilled Operatives and Unskilled - twenty four persons

As it relates to Account Code 6116 - Contracted Employees - I would proceed to say there are seventeen persons employed on contract. The positions are:

- One driver;
- One Research Assistant - Salary \$59,000;



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Two Secretary Typists - Salary \$51,000;
- Telephonist - Salary \$35,000
- Two Drivers - Salary \$48,000;
- Technical Assistant - Salary \$229,000;
- One Research Assistant - Salary \$75,000,000;
- Stock Verifier - Salary \$43,000;
- One Assistant Field Auditor - Salary \$58,000;
- Pool Attendant - Salary \$29,000;
- Store Keeper - Salary \$48,000

**The Chairman:** Yes, Mr Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Could the Honourable Minister please explain to the National Assembly whether there any of those positions identified as contracted employees also in the regular categories of Administrative, Senior Technical, Other technical, Clerical and Office Support, Semi Skilled Operatives and Un-Skilled also employed under those categories.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I would say Sir, the answer is no.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister explain to the National Assembly why it was preferable to put certain categories like Secretaries, Personal Assistants which are normal public

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

service type positions under contracted employees and not in the regular public service?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I think, while the Honourable Member might be seeking some clarification, I would want to say that the issue is we cannot attract some of the persons who are much more technical; people now want to work perhaps on a short term basis rather than staying in the public service on an extended basis, where they are guaranteed security of tenure and at the same time, the persons employed on contract compliment the skills pool within most of our line ministries.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, is the Honourable Minister then agree that some of these contracted employee positions are created so that you can pay differential salaries and allowances over and above those with traditional public servants occupying those positions would normally earn.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, some of these positions if you were to do a comparative analysis, I think the Public Service Ministry has sought to regularise the salaries, so all the salaries of contracted employees are now within the salary scales. So I am not sure and there is very little disparity now in that regard.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Sir, just a clarification, because I want this on the public record, is the Honourable saying that contracted employees now who are in positions similar to those in the public service are earning no

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

differential in remuneration? Is that what you are saying, Madame?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, in response to that question, I am saying that what Government has sought to do is to ensure now that the salaries of persons paid on contracts are within the authorised salary scales of the Public Service.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Sir, if that is so, Mde Minister ... *[Interruption]*

**The Chairman:** That is a very technical answer Mr Murray, because you might have a position attracting a salary of \$100 to \$200, but a person might be paid \$200 to \$300, but that does not necessarily mean from how I figure out the answer that that is necessarily outside the scale of anything, because if the Public Service is paying that scale for something else, it is still within the scale of the Public Service. I do not know if you figure out the answer.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** No, and that is why I asked for similar positions in the Public Service, because you could not take a position under contracted employee and find another not comparable to that in the Public Service which paid similar salary and say that you are evening out the terms and conditions. That clearly would be ludicrous to us a word, but the question that arises in my mind, which I would like to ask the Minister is why if you are paying the same terms and conditions to contracted employees as for similar categories in the Public Service,

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

why are you creating this unnecessary categorisation of contract employees when there is a traditional Public Service framework for the employment of persons? Is that to give you more discretion as to who you appoint whereas public servants have to go through a more public scrutiny process? Is that the idea? *[Applause]*

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I do not agree with the Honourable Member, because the process of recruitment is quite transparent. For anyone to be recruited in Government they have to get approval of the Public Service Ministry. So it is not that persons are appointed on an ad hoc basis. There is a procedure and the Public Service Ministry is authorised to give approval to fill those positions and the Public Service Ministry also sets the salaries for those positions. So it is not that persons' salaries are set on an ad hoc basis and as I said earlier, they are done in accordance with approved salary scale. Those persons' salaries are set within those salary scales.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Riehl

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, a supplementary, you said one of contracted employees is a Research Assistant receiving \$229,000 per month. Is that correct, Madame?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** That is a technical Officer. Mr Chairman, that person is the holder of a Masters Degree and if you were to check that salary is in accordance with the Salary Scale Grade 12, persons employed with Masters Degree are paid on GS 12.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, this is my last question on this particular matter. Mde Minister, would you not agree that it will much more transparent and helpful to this National Assembly and perhaps to remove the need for us to ask you these questions if you were to include in the Estimates brought to this House the information you provided with respect to the authorised strength and secondly to include in the relevant appendices at the back of the Estimates the categories of contracted employees that you have and the salaries that are paid so that the National Assembly is informed in advance.

**The Chairman:** You will then about that, would you not, Honourable Member?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I was just going to say that.

**The Chairman:** Is there any other question?

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I wish to ask the Honourable Minister what category of vehicles come under Account Code 6241 that the office of the President is renting.

**The Chairman:** That is buildings, Account Code 6241.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Rental of buildings.

**Hon Jennifer I Speaker:** Mr Chairman, in response to that question asked by the Honourable Member Mrs Riehl, the Office of the President pays for the rental of accommodation for several Government Ministers at

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Achillibar Villas and we have to pay this money to the Ministry of Public Works.

**The Chairman:** Judges live there too so don't worry.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Yes.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** I would now like to go to Account Code 6321 - Subsidies and Contributions to Local Organisations - under the same Programme 011 and I would like if the Minister could follow me and turn to the relevant Page 414 towards the back of the Estimates which lists the various agencies and the quantum of financial resources being made available to them. My question to the Honourable Minister is this - is the Minister aware that the Auditor General has adversely commented in his Reports of 2005 and many prior years of the fact that the Joint Intelligence Coordinating Centre, Castellani House, Presidential Guard Service and GINA are properly departments of the Office of the President and are therefore not eligible for Subsidies and Contributions, but rather should come within the line allocations of the Agency. That is my first question. Is she aware?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Yes, I am aware of that, Mr Chairman.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mde Minister thru' you Sir, if you are aware of that why are you continuing to flout the very direct attention being focussed by the Auditor General on the impropriety - why are you continuing to

## **BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

flout this direction by the Auditor General that they should be placed in line items within the Office of the President rather than being given subventions. None of them is a semi-autonomous agency or a statutory agency, they are all departments and all departments are supposed to be financed in the ordinary course of things as line items under the Ministry or Agency. Why is that not being done in these cases and in the Office of the President?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman in response to that question, I think that their subventions are disbursed directly to them en bloc on a monthly basis. I do not think that it is intentional that the Office of the President intends to flout the recommendations. I want to say and put on record here that right now through the Public Management Modernisation Programme which concluded in December, there was a components which dealt with semi-autonomous bodies and how they should operate and the government is awaiting the outcome of those reports from the Consultants and as to how semi-autonomous agencies will operate within the financial framework. I think Government will address some of these concerns in the near future.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Thru' you Mr Chairman, is the Honourable Minister aware that she is making a presumption that is not yet a reality namely that Presidential Guard Service and these other units are semi-autonomous agencies. They are not, that is the whole point the Auditor General is making and until such time

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

that you make them semi-autonomous agencies, Mde Minister, why are you not complying with normal requirement of the laws which says departments should be line items within an agency? I do not care what report you are awaiting, but in the mean time comply with the law.

**The Chairman:** Your intention is to comply at some time in the future. Isn't that so, Honourable Member?

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, the same Account Code 6321 - Subsidies and Contributions to Local Organisations - if we look at Page 414, the National Parks Commission, the budget is for \$99, 800,000 and the question I would like to address to the Honourable Minister thru' you is whether in view of what has been repeatedly said about Critchlow Labour College whether the Minister is in receipt of financial statements from the National Parks Commission and also whether they are satisfied with the performance of the National Parks Commission to the extent that they would want to pump an additional \$12,000,000 into their operations.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** First of all in response to that question the sum voted here in this year's annual budget of \$99,000,000 for the National Parks Commission only represents a portion of the operational cost of the Commission. The National Parks Commission has to also generate revenues to meets its entire operational costs for the entire year and that \$99,000,000 based on their budget submission is only a mere fifty percent of what the



## **BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Commission... it is not only the National Parks Commission that falls under that ... the Joe Vieira Park, the Botanical Gardens, the Zoological Park, Kaieteur National Park and the total budget for that agency is in excess of \$185,-000,000 for 2008. So it means that the Commission has to generate revenues to meet its shortfall. That increase that the Honourable Member is talking about basically represents the nine percent across-the-board increase for which those employees would have received in 2007 and that extra \$12,000,000 is really the nine percent that represents employment cost for staff members within the Commission.

In terms of performance, the National Parks Commission falls under the Office of the President and the performance of the Commission would be reviewed at a policy level by the Office of the President.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** That really does not answer my question. Perhaps I put it badly. Is the Honourable Minister thru' you, she said it is not the whole thing, it is half, are you satisfied and is the Office of the President satisfied that the money spent is money being well spent and you are getting value for money. That is the question I am asking.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** In response to that question, I would say yes, because the National Parks Commission needs more resources than what we are providing.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Murray

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, I know that the Presidential Guard Service is a matter of some sensitivity and I appreciate that, but I do not believe that in the interest of transparency the information I am about to request falls into any category of sensitivity. Could the Honourable Minister say on how many persons are employed in the Presidential Guard Service on which spend \$192,000,000 annually. The number of persons, not where they are deployed, what they do and who they protect; I am not asking that Sir. I am asking a very simple question. What is the number of persons employed? What is the strength of this Organisation, because we are spending \$192,000,000 of public funds and I think this Assembly has the right to know the number of people on whom it is spent?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I would not be able to provide that information, because I think in the interest of national security I would not.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** The next question, the usual efforts of transparency - Sir, National Communications Network - Now, I note here this organisation is going to receive a subvention, a subsidy or contribution whichever you want to call it of \$50,000,000 in 2008. I want to know and I believe this House would be interested in knowing, why is it not possible for this organisation twenty-four hours per day on the air to earn more money and make itself independently viable so that the public purse does not have to carry such a large subsidy or

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

contribution to it. Why is it that is not possible? Maybe we will have an explanation.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, in response to that question, I want to say that the money voted here for the National Communications Network represents a mere twenty-five percent of the Agency's employment cost. I think, the operations of NCN generate their own revenues. That Agency has programmed as its expenditure for 2008 in excess of \$500,000,000 and what is being voted here is just a percentage. Their employment cost is in excess of \$120,000,000. So I think the National Communications Network in itself is moving towards making its operations viable. I think at some point in time, we would not have to give that Agency any subvention.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mde Minister, would you not agree that the last thing an organisation should seek a subvention for is to pay its employees. I could understand an organisation needing a subvention to meet other costs. Why isn't NCN at the minimum able to bear all of its employment cost, maybe it is overpaying the people; don't you think or is it over staffed? Which?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I do not think in response to the question that the Agency is overpaying its staff.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Well, is it underpaying?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** They operate within the levels of the Government Service.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Then, Madame is it overstaffed?

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** On the same Account Code - the National Communications Network - the Honourable Minister indicated that they expect that a time will soon come when die to increased efficiency; they would be able to discontinue this allowance or this stipend. Would the Minister agree with me that when you look at Budget, last year we gave them \$30,474,000; this year we are giving them \$50,000,000? Is that an indication of an agency, which is on the way on the way to be self-sustained? I would think it should go down. If we had seen it go down from \$30,000,000 perhaps to \$20,000,000 then your argument would have been logical.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, we all know that the National Communications Network is expanding their services throughout Guyana, Linden, Anna Regina, Benab, New Amsterdam and they have not only employment cost to meet, but cost of utility charges and all of that.

**Agency 01 - Office of the President, Programme 011 - Head Office Administration - \$1,387,422,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 32 and 33 ...

**AGENCY 01 -OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT,  
Programme 012 - Presidential Advisory (Cabinet and  
Other Services)**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$274,221,000 for Agency 01 - Office of the President, Programme 012 - Presidential Advisory (Cabinet and Other Services) - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mr Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister kindly inform the National Assembly as to the authorised strength of the categories of Account Codes 6111 through 6115.

Secondly, she seems capable of coping with more than one question at a time, Sir. Could she provide the information on contracted employees as in the last case the number, the position and the emoluments?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, under:

- Account Code 6111 - Administrative there is one person;
- Account Code 6112 - Senior Technical there is not staff;
- Account Code 6113 - Other Technical and Craft Skilled there is one person;

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support there are three persons;
- Account Code 6115 - Semi Skilled Operatives and Unskilled there are two employees;
- Account Code 6116 - Contracted Employees there are sixty-eight persons.

Those positions include:

- Head of the Presidential Secretariat;
- Special Projects Officers;
- Cabinet monitoring Officers;
- Protocol Advisers... *[Interruption]*

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Could she give us the emoluments as she goes along Sir? It would be helpful. That is what we asked, Sir.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I do not ... *[Interruption]*

**Mr Winston S Murray:** National Security!

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** No, I was not going to say that. I know that persons' salaries are normally personal to them, but nevertheless, I will start over:

- Head of the Presidential Secretariat - \$675,000
- Special Project Officers - \$80,000
- Technical Officers - \$97,000

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Cabinet Monitoring Officers - \$106,000
- Community Relations Officer - \$52,000
- Protocol Adviser - \$173,000
- Manager - \$77,000
- Three Personal Assistants - \$35,000  
each
- Household Service Workers - \$37,000
- Advisers - \$150,000
- Archivist - \$150,000
- Assistant Archivist - \$70,000
- Word Processing Officers - \$51,000

I think I have captured most of the categories here, Sir.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Could the Honourable Minister kindly make available the full list along with the emoluments. I hope she appreciates it will be difficult to absorb all of that in the short moment. In any case, it is unfair to expect her to go through a list of sixty-eight persons.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I think that information is public. All those persons are on the authorised payroll.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Since it is public, can the Minister then tell me where exactly may I go and find that information, Madame?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** The information can be supplied.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** What did she say, Sir? We did not hear.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I said, it can be supplied.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Oh, thank you.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I wish to ask the Minister about the category of temporary employment. I see you have \$15,000,000 for temporary employment. What categories of employment would constitute temporary employees?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, the household domestics to Ministers are paid under tat Subhead. That expenditure is met by the Office of the President and those workers are deemed temporary employees.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Carberry

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman, I get the impression from the answer given by the Minister that the column entitled Filled is equal to a missing column called authorised strength. Is that true?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, as I said earlier, the Public Service Ministry deals with positions to be created and to be filled and as it is stated here, Sir, I



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

think there is no vacant post within that organisation. The actual strength is what is authorised there.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** A follow-up - Mr Chairman, given the answer that we have just been given, could we then expect that when we deal with the Public Service Ministry, that we will be provided with that authorised strength for all of these agencies.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Well I would want to say that my colleague would be in a better position to answer that question.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Backer.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister thru' you be kind enough to inform this National Assembly how many Presidential Advisers are captured in Account Code 6116 - Contracted Employees?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I think all the Presidential Advisers are captured.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** How many?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** According to the records three. I do not know of any other.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Would the Honourable Minister indicate what the three Presidential are doing ... on Environment, on Security on Buxton, whatever it is?

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I do not have that information here.

**Mr Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman thru' you, would the Honourable Minister be prepared to provide, because there are only three Mde Minister, it should not be difficult.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, there is a Presidential Advisor on governance; on environment and sustainable development and one on Internal Affairs.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Would the Honourable Minister indicate what the salaries of these Presidential Advisers are?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** I think I said that the salaries are \$150,000,000. I said that.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Thank you very much.

**Agency 01 - Office of the President, Programme 012 - Presidential Advisory (Cabinet and Other Services) - \$274,221,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 36 and 37

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**AGENCY 01 - OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT,  
Programme 014 - Public Policy and Planning**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$190,000 for Agency 01 - Office of the President, Programme 014 - Public Policy and Planning - stands part of the Estimates

**Agency 01 - Office of the President, Programme 014 - Public Policy and Planning - \$190,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Page 426

**AGENCY 01 -OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT -  
CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$311,936,000 for Agency 01 - Office of the President - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates

The Honourable Member Mr Winston S Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, is this the capital expenditure, Sir?

**The Chairman:** Yes, Page 426, the same Volume.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Thank You. I would like to direct attention to Project Code 1700100 - Minor Works - Mde Minister, my first question - Would you agree that

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

since this is an item of capital expenditure that the resources allocated to it should not be spent on current revenue items?

**The Chairman:** That is a lawyer's question. That question is a set up, so I am warning you.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I would say no.

**The Chairman:** So Minister, you are saying that it is okay to violate ... [*Interruption: 'Ask the question'*] That is the question, Sir. You do not understand a question. It is okay to violate the directions of the Ministry of Finance that current expenditures cannot take place out of capital allocations.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, in response to that question, I would say that answer is no. No one should violate.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Well that's it. Mde Minister, in the circumstances, would you therefore agree that to spend the sums of money here on hotel accommodation, transportation, catering services and gifts to individuals are in fact in violation of the requirements of capital expenditure?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I think the Honourable Member is perhaps making some reference or inference comments made in the Auditor General's Report. However, Sir, I would want to say that I think that categorising transportation and donations given by the Head of State perhaps to charity institutions like the

## **BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Blind Institute ... I am just using a case here in point ... it cannot be current expenditure, because it is really persons... done from this Head, Sir, and the programme is demand-driven. It is really meant to meet small needs and it is for projects of humanitarian outreach, developmental activities as requested by communities and organisations to the Head of State throughout this country. I think these projects are approved by the Head of State. Under this vote, no expenditure is authorised unless it has the direct approval of the Head of State. All these projects, et cetera, are done in accordance with his approval and his commitments to those institutions, communities, et cetera.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, just permit me a sentence, Sir, I want to say categorically that there is no intention to challenge the Head of State's right to expend the monies allocated here - \$80,000,000 - in a way that is consistent with what is demanded by the citizens. So it is an issue that has to do with how you satisfy the requirements to separate current expenditure from capital expenditure and I only wanted to draw attention to the fact that the Auditor General has said that there has not been a quite proper use of the resources and to ask that that be complied with. That is all, Madame.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I think in response to that question, I know for sure that the Office of the President is taking into account those concerns and they will in future separate some of the expenditures of a

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

current nature to the Head of State and try to meet it from their current vote.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Very, very good. I applaud that answer. Mr Chairman, I just have one other question and then I have nothing else here. There are two items of capital expenditure here, Projects Codes 3400900 and 4401600; in the first instance there is a sum of \$171,194,000 and in the second \$100,000,000, but there are no project profiles for these sums, which are capital expenditures. [*Interruption: 'There is no provision.'*] Oh, there is no provision, I am sorry, my question is irrelevant.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Norton.

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 3400600 - National Parks Commission - Purchase of vehicle, machinery and equipment - when we go to the Project Profile it identifies a number of things, could the Honourable say first of all what is the need for this walk-in freezer and what is the cost of the walk-in freezer.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, this walk-in freezer is for the Guyana Zoological Park and the cost of this walk-in Freezer is \$2,097,280.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** I do not think, if I could, seeing I am on my feet, we have been told which agency it is for - the Zoological Park - but what is the purpose of this

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

freezer? Surely you would have asked before you give them.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, it is to store food items, meat and so forth for the animals.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mde Minister thru' the Chairman, we see here on the same profile Page 7, which is in relation to the same National Parks Commission, the four items being purchased, the second one speaks about purchase of security system, could the Honourable Minister indicate to this House where this security system being placed? In other words, which of the entities, the National Park where Mr Ramotar and I go in the mornings or the Zoological Park, where?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I think there has been a high incidence of theft at the National Parks Commission, in the Botanical Gardens where there is the nursery, the stores and so on. Basically this is to install cameras around the stores areas and they sell plants and they suffered a lot of young plants and around the Zoo. There is where the cameras will be installed.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mde Minister thru' you Mr Chairman, the chain is confusing me a bit; chainsaws, brush cutters and slashers, which would be item 3. Could the Honourable Minister say whether some of these things will find their way to be used in the National Park in particular the brush cutters and slashes? I am asking these questions, because unlike previous years where the National Park was kept in very pristine conditions, it is

## **BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

now over-grown; there are wild animals roaming. I am not exaggerating, so I want to know whether the brush cutters and the slashers (and I do not mean Mr Ramotar) are going to be used in the National Parks Commission. In response to that question, I would say the answer is yes.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Norton

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** Project Code 4502100 - National Communication Network - the Legend says purchase and installation of transmitters and other equipment - when we come to the actual profile it says purchase and installation of transmitters and purchase of equipment. Could you indicate what equipment is to be bought here? Secondly, could you state how many transmitters and what they will be used for, which area they will target and where they will be placed?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, the NCN will be acquiring this year three transmitters and they will also be replacing the current FM transmitter. The sums voted here are to provide transmitters for Anna Regina, Benab in Corriverton and also to replace the links to the transmitters.

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** A follow-up - I did ask for the cost of a transmitter vis-à-vis the other equipment and for a breakdown on the equipment that will be purchased.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, in response to that question, I think notwithstanding the transmitters are



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

being installed, we also have to cost the equipment to support the installation.

- For Anna Regina it is going to cost \$11.7 million. This is for making the connections from Georgetown;
- To replace that FM transmitter, it will cost \$33.6 million. This is for transmitter and all the other ancillary components required to install and replace that FM transmitter; and
- For the Benab area another \$17 million.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Lance Carberry

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Minister, are these transmitters part of the expansion of the signal programmed for NCN?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I am advised that these transmitters are to support the operations of the three community stations that I identified earlier.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** The question I am asking is whether or not this is part of the expansion of the signal programme for NCN. Let me know whether it is yes or no.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** The answer is no.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Thank you very much.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 01 - Office of the President - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$311,936,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 68 and 69 ...

I would like to alert Honourable Members that you need to watch the timing, because some of these items are pretty controversial (it is not for me to say that) but I have a suspicion that on some of these items as we go down, you might want to spend some extra time. So you need to watch your timing as we go along. That is just a friendly advice.

**AGENCY 09 - PUBLIC AND POLICE SERVICE COMMISSIONS, Programme 091 - Public and Police Service Commissions**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$47,990,000 for Agency 09 - Public and Police Service Commissions, Programme 091 - Public and Police Service Commissions - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mrs Clarissa Riehl

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I wish to ask the Honourable Minister, I do not know which Minister will answer ... I see here Account Codes 6111 to 6115 and there is a total

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

of thirty-two employees in the Staffing Details. Now of the thirty-two employees five are contracted employees receiving \$9.6 million and the others which is almost one-fifth of the total amount budgeted here for the Public and Police Service Commissions. I wish to ask who are these five contracted employees and the emoluments and which of the Service Commissions whether it is the Police or the Public Commission they are attached to. I do not know who is the Minister I am speaking to.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, there are five contracted employees:

Secretary to the Public Service Commission;

- A Principal Personal Officer;
- A Driver; and
- Two Assistant Development Officers.

This is more or less a secretariat of persons who are supporting both the Police and the Public Service Commissions.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** The emoluments of these five contracted employees.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I am advised that one person has been transferred so there are in fact four.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I asked for the emoluments of the emoluments.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, we do not have the details of the emoluments at this moment, but they could be provided.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Are you undertaking to supply them Honourable Minister?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** That is what I said.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** You said they could be, but I do not know if it could be.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Yes, we have no problem in providing the information.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Thank you.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Carberry

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman thru' you again, could we be informed of the authorised strength; we have noticed that there are the filled positions, but we do not have any idea of the authorised strength and therefore we do not know whether or not these filled positions are equal to the authorised strength. First of all, could the Minister tell us whether these positions are equalled to the authorised strength or if not what is the authorised strength?

**Hon BH Robeson:** Mr Chairman, the number 32 is also the authorised strength.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** I am sorry, Sir.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** In the Staffing Details...

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** You mean to say that all of these numbers here under Filled represent the authorised strength.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Yes.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** So you have no vacancies at all.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Not that I am aware of.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Thank you very much.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Norton

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister explain what factors informed the situation where four people would earn \$9.627 million and sixteen people will earn a small and small amount of \$6,592,000.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I did say that I would provide some information, but I am saying fundamentally it is a matter of scale and function.

**Agency 09 - Programme 091 - Public and Police Service Commissions, Programme 091 - Public and Police Service Commissions - \$47,990,000 agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 433 ...

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**AGENCY 09 - PUBLIC AND POLICE SERVICE  
COMMISSIONS - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE -  
Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$ 1,500,000 for Agency 09 - Public and Police Service Commissions - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

**Agency 09 - Programme 091 - Public and Police Service Commissions, Programme 091 - Public and Police Service Commissions - \$1.500.000 agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 72 and 73...

**AGENCY 10 - TEACHING SERVICE  
COMMISSION, Programme 101 - Teaching Service  
Commission**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$53,653,000 for Agency 10 - Teaching Service Commission, Programme 101 - Teaching Service Commission - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, would the Honourable Minister inform this House who are the five

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

contracted employees, the positions that they hold and the remuneration of each of those five positions?

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Minister

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the five contracted employees comprised of;

- Two Drivers;
- One Confidential Secretary;
- One Personal Assistant to the Chairperson; and
- An Assistant Analyst.

With respect to the emoluments that information could also be provided.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Account Code 6281 - Security Services - A figure of \$2,016,000, could the Honourable Minister inform this House which security service has been contracted to provide this service?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the Special Constabulary of the Guyana Police Force is in fact the Security Service.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Since we are not assisted by having a table of authorised strength in the document, I wonder whether the Minister could confirm whether the position under the column Filled for 2008 are equal to the authorised strength for this department.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, in fact the authorised strength is forty-six persons.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Could you say where the vacancies exist in that forty-six?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I do not have that level of detail at this moment, but the information could be supplied.

**Agency 10 - Teaching Service Commission, Programme 101 - Teaching Service Commission - \$53,653,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 434 ...

**AGENCY 10 - TEACHING SERVICE COMMISSION - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$4,000,000 for Agency 10 - Teaching Service Commission - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mrs Backer



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister inform this Honourable House ... we see a figure of \$4,000,000 and when we look at the Project Profile Page which is Page 40, we see payment of retention, rehabilitation of building, purchase of filing cabinets, chairs and desks. Could the Minister give us the breakdown of this \$4,000,000; what will go to each of the three heads?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, \$247,000 represents retention for work that flowed over from the previous year and \$3,000,000 will go into the rehabilitation of the building.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** What about the filing cabinets?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I think you expect that the Teaching Service Commission would use filing cabinets and they would have to be paid for.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, I would refrain from saying what I want to say, but I will ask very specifically, how much money has been identified for the purchase of filing cabinets, chairs and desks - one figure would do to cover all three?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, G\$763,000

**Agency 10 - Teaching Service Commission, Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$4,000,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 76 and 77 ...

**AGENCY 11 - ELECTIONS COMMISSION,  
Programme 111 - Elections Commission**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$1,918,574,000 for Agency 11, Programme 111 - Elections Commission - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Ms Ally

**Ms Anna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support - in light of the heightened activities of this entity, could the Minister say what is responsible for the reduction of the clerical staff from 139 to 104.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, there have been some resignations which resulted in the lowering of the number of the staff.

**Ms Anna Ally:** A supplementary Mr Chairman - in view of the resignations, is there any indications that these vacancies will be filled and resignations from which sections?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the area refers to Clerical and Office Support and these would be advertised.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Riehl

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, would the Honourable Minister answer what is the strength of the various authorised Account Codes 6111, 6112, 6113, 6114 and 6115?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6111 - Administrative - that authorised strength is four persons; Account Code 6112 - Senior Technical - six persons; Account Code 6113 - Other Technical and Craft Skilled - thirty-one persons; Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support - 104 persons.

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman, I wonder whether the Minister remembers that he did indicate that he had a vacancy under Account Code 6114 and therefore is the authorised strength is 104 then there could be no vacancy.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think I did indicate that we have 139 positions of which 104 are filled?

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Danny, you wanted to ask a question.

**Mr Dave Danny:** Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support - I have observed that even though there is a reduction from Account Codes 6114 5 to 6116 - there is an increase in the contracted worker; my question is, is there a preference for contracted workers.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I am advised that the Commission does not want to commit itself in

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

terms of long term service employees; in this case with respect to pension and gratuity.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Patterson

**Mr David Patterson:** Account Code 6294 - Other - could the Honourable Minister please provide details of the \$824,900,000? Is this amount includes the payment of scrutineers?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** No, Mr Chairman.

**Mr David Patterson:** Can you detail what expenses are captured under the Account Code Other.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** For the payment of temporary field staff who numbered 2,066.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Members Ms Ally, Mrs Riehl and then Mr Ramjattan, so you can proceed in that order.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6284 - Other - could the Honourable Minister give some details on what *Other* means?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, *Other* refers to certain activities:

- consolidation of electoral laws,
- review of all internal processes;
- GECOM's Security Box at GBTI;
- rental of containers;

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- hiring of labourers;
- production;
- publication, broadcast of appropriate motivation message to publish various aspects of registration;
- distribution of ID Cards in the form of radio, television broadcast, mobile, caravans, print media or the use of fliers, posters, tee-shirts, bell criers, hire of public address system, et cetera;
- civic and voter education support of the registration period;
- legal matters,
- Ram and McRae Consultant Services;
- posting and abating of websites.

**The Chairman:** A follow-up Mrs Ally?

**Ms Amna Ally:** Yes. May I ask the Minister to tell us whether this includes the production of new ID cards?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** No, Mr Chairman. I think is refer to the distribution of ID Cards.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Riehl

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I have to go back to the Contracted Employees, I think that answer given by the Honourable Minister in answer to Mr Danny whether there is a preference for contracted employees and he said

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

in a kind of way the answer is yes, because he does not want to be bugged with pensions and gratuity issues.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Long term

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I would like to ask the Honourable Minister whether these contracted employees are not in receipt of gratuity, because I know the system of giving gratuity to contracted employees every three months.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Certainly, the short term - every six months or so there is a gratuity - 22½ percent is the usual sum.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Ramjattan

**Mr Khemraj Ramjattan:** Mr Chairman, under this entire category here, is there any money put aside for the payment of scrutineers?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think I answered that question already. I am beginning to wonder whether there is some kind of vested interested here.

**Mr Khemraj Ramjattan:** You said under Other, there is no scrutineers' payment, but I am talking about the whole page now.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** The answer is again no

**Mr Khemraj Ramjattan:** Okay, could I have a follow-up - In view of the fact that Section of the Elections Law

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

says that the Elections Commission must have Parliamentary approval for scrutineers' payment, where is the payment for scrutineers that Parliament approved for this year?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, there is none. The activity for the payment of scrutineers does not fall under the Office of GECOM and so there is none. I cannot answer for any other agency on this matter. I am speaking for GECOM on the matter and I am saying that there is none. It does not come under the responsibility of GECOM.

**Mr Khemraj Ramjattan:** So Section 21 of the Elections Laws that specifically states that scrutineers' payment should be determined by GECOM and approved by the National Assembly, is there a breach of Section 21?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think the operative word spoken by the Honourable Member is determined by GECOM and not paid. So there is none. I said it three times already.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs David

**Mrs Judith David-Blair:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support - it is shown here that in 2007 it was 139 and in 2008, - Filled is only 104, it means that thirty-five persons are not there. Could the Minister say what positions these people hold; then when you look at the allocation as compared to 2007, it is just about \$742,000.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I believe I did answer this question before when I spoke about resignations under the head.

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** Mr Chairman, the Honourable Minister in responding to the GECOM's question said the operative word is determined, but there were two operative words, one was determined by GECOM and approved by the National Assembly. It follows as a natural sequel that somewhere here, there should be the allocation. Could the Honourable Minister say in keeping with the section which says it has to be approved by the National Assembly, where is it. *[Applause]*

**The Chairman:** I think we have gone through that already. It is not there Honourable Member

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** That is my advice.

**The Chairman:** I think the Minister said that several times that scrutineers' payment are not provided for.

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** Mr Speaker, he did not say that. What he said was first that the operative word was determined; one could have inferred from that that he was saying that it was not under his purview, then I proceeded to point out that it says as well it should be approved by the National Assembly and if it has to be approved by the National Assembly then it means it has to come before the National Assembly; where is it; when will it?

**The Chairman:** Honourable Members, the process is to determine the issue as presented to us in the Estimates.



## **BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

This is not a debate as to whether something should or should not mean; that is a very legitimate debate and that law on the issue cited there are very legitimate issues, but this is not the place for it. That has to take place under some other procedure. We flex a little bit here, but the question technically should not be allowed; where is the item for scrutineers; that is not a proper question, but I allowed it and the Minister answered three times and said there is no provision in the current Estimates for scrutineers. What the law says and the law does not say is another matter; the Minister (to use his own words) is not within his remit. So we can proceed with the next matter please.

The Honourable Member Mr Carberry

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman, in the interest of transparency, one would have thought that if GECOM is supposed to determine what that amount is that at least the Minister can say that GECOM has determined that amount, but it is really under another agency. That is transparency and I do not know that that is illegitimate for us as a National Assembly to require. It is simple, GECOM is supposed to determine that amount; first question, has GECOM determined that amount? If it is not reflected in the GECOM's budget, where is it reflected? That is all we are asking.

**The Chairman:** Mr Carberry, if the Minister wants to answer that question that is a matter entirely for him, but that is not a legitimate question.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Honourable Minister, do you wish to answer that question?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** No, Mr Chairman.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mr Deborah J Backer:** Account Code 81 - Security Services - Could the Honourable Minister indicate whether it is the Special Constabulary again, if not, which Security Service?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the Special Constabulary helps a list which includes United Associates, Kalidor Investigative Unit and NM Solutions. So there are four different services who are involved in the provision of security in the ten regions throughout the country.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Was this done by public tendering - the methodology used to employ these security services?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Yes, Mr Chairman, it was done by a public tender process.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Could the Honourable Minister indicate which of these four entities has the bulk of the security contract.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I am advised the United Associates has the most services to provide, because they have a presence in all of the regions.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Would the Honourable Minister be in a position to indicate to us what percentage they have; in other words do they have twenty/thirty/forty percentage? I just want to get a picture.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I do not have that specific information, it can be provided, but I point again to the geographic spread with respect to the particular agency's service.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Would the Minister agree that if he does not have the breakdown, the how is he in a position to say categorically which one has the majority?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Because I was advised and I passed on that advised to you that they had the geographic spread and in terms of information that is on hand, they cover the largest area and won the tenders in terms of amount.

**Mr Basil Williams:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6222 - Field Materials and Supplies - Can I ask the Minister, does this head include materials for the current house-to-house registration?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Yes, Mr Chairman, it does.

**Mr Basil Williams:** Is materials for the new ID Cards encompassed by this head?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think I spoke about the distribution of ID Cards and field staff, issues with regard to film and so on, yes, there would be

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

materials which would be bought with respect to the distribution of ID cards.

**Mr Basil Williams:** So that answer is yes. Under this head there is provision ... *[Interruption]*

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I would like to clarify, I said ... *[Interruption]*

**The Chairman:** I understand what you are saying, distribution of ID Cards.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** ... distribution of ID Cards.

**The Chairman:** I understand that Honourable Member.

**Mr Basil Williams:** I am not talking about ID Cards.

**The Chairman:** Ms Ally first.

**Ms Anna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6294 - Other - As you know the current registration process is going on and it would seem as though there would be the production of ID Cards, I wish to ask the Minister whether this Other here embodied the cost for the production of these ID Cards.

**Hon BH Robeson:** Mr Chairman, it refers to the production of ID Cards and their distribution.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Danny

**Mr Dave Danny:** Mr Chairman Account Code 6263 - Postage, Telex and Cablegrams - In 2007 there was

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

\$73,000 and in 2008 there is \$10,500,000, can the Minister explain these numbers?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Can the Honourable Member please repeat the Code?

**Mr Dave Danny:** Account Code 6263, it is postage and telex, Page 76 at the bottom.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, simply put and it was said that the registration exercise is on the way, so the postage and all those charges would naturally go up. I think the Honourable Member is referring to the magnitude of the increase. There was not activity in the previous year and now there is a lot of people going around in the regions and the postage and communications would have to be paid for is being met out of this amount.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Patterson

**Mr David Patterson:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6265 - Other Transport, Travel and Postage - based on the answer the Honourable Minister just provided, because of the house-to-house registration postage has gone up; can he provide the details of other transportation, travel and postage?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, under this Code, there are various modes of transportation; preparation of the conduct of elections; hire of boats, trucks; charter of aircrafts by ROs for the movement of materials to and from their areas over a two-months period; civic and

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

voter education support; hire of car, relating to the collecting of ID Cards and activities relating in the various districts, posting of the official list of electors at the Divisions and Sub-Divisions; seventy-one Returning Officers offices and at 1,700 polling stations, charter of aircraft for the conduct of the Disciplined Services balloting in hinterland locations; transport staff and polling materials that is ballot boxes and ballot papers to and from polling stations with security too for the conduct of the poll on elections day; transportation ROs and Supervisors and so on.

**Mr David Patterson:** Mr Chairman, based on the very detailed answer from the Minister, can the Minister explain what is captured under Account Code 6261 - Local Travel and Subsistence - because we are given an extremely detailed travel itinerary under Account Code 6265?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, under Local Travel and Subsistence, there will be visits to twenty-seven Registration Offices and Sub-Offices monthly by the Managers and Election Officers; visits to Head Office of the twenty-seven Registration Officers weekly; visit of the Chief Accountant and Staff to GECOM's Offices in the various districts; visits of Store Superintendents, security officers and Admin Staff to the various districts; there will be travel and subsistence incurred by the other departments in the execution of their duties; civic and voter education support, the hire of public transportation

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

and subsistence incurred by the field staff to get their work done over a five-month period.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Norton

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** Mr Chairman, thru' you to the Honourable Minister, could the Honourable Minister tell us how much is expended on Account Code 6263 on postage and how much is expended on Account Code 6265 on postage?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Could the Honourable Member repeat the Account Codes?

**Mr Aubrey Norton:** For your information and I hope this time with clarity, Account Code 6263 - what amount of it is postage; Account Code 6265 - what amount of that one is postage?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, Under Account Code 6263 this will deal with the postage of letters and packages for the distribution and upliftment of ID Cards - \$48,000,000 will be the cost of registered mail for 600,000 persons to collect ID Cards. That is the estimate.

**Mr David Patterson:** Can you repeat please?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Sorry Mr Chairman. That I think would be \$.8 million for postage under the registered mail system for persons to collect their ID Cards. Under Account Code 6265, there would be hired of transportation on a monthly basis again for field visits of Registration Officers ... *[Interruption: 'We asked for*

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

*Postage.*'] There is no postage under Account Code 6265. [Interruption: 'It says other transport, travel and postage.'] There is no postage here; the Head is described as other transport, travel and postage. In fact the amounts are identified basically for other transport and travel. I think I said no postage already.

**Mr Aubrey C Norton:** So in other words postage should not be here.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I said that the Code is identified specifically as *Other Transport, Travel and Postage*, but in fact the monies are being spent for other transport and travel. [Interruption: 'So the heading is misleading.'] The heading is not misleading. Now, let me explain, if you look at other Code it has Local Travel and Subsistence, the specific Code is Other Transport, Travel and Postage. It does not mean that you would necessarily spend money on each unit under the Code.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Thank you very much Minister Benn. Account Code 6265 - Other Transport, Travel and Postage - I am going back, could the Honourable Minister explain ... we see in the Budget for 2007 a figure of \$78,445,000 allocated and then it was revised downwards to \$4,456,000, I presume because no elections were held in that year, yet in the year 2008, when we expect elections to be held, there is a reduction of about \$23,000,000 when you compare the budget for 2007 and 2008, could the Honourable Member explain that decrease.



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think the budget went through a number of iterations as the Honourable Member pointed out elections were not held, however, quite a bit of the groundwork relating to the elections were actually done in 2007, house-to-house registration and so on. So the resultant in terms of the estimate for this year, this is the considered amount that is needed for this activity.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Would the Minister agree with me that when you add the \$4,456,000 that was actually spend in 2007 and the \$55,250,000 that is now anticipated, there is still a difference of about \$18,000,000.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think I did say that the groundwork was done. They were able to obtain some synergies and efficiencies and therefore savings and this is a good thing.

**Mrs Judith David-Blair:** Mr Chairman, Account Codes 6261 and 6265 especially 6261, I would like to know how much of this money is allocated for Region 7 and if the Minister can provide me with a copy of the proposed expenditure for these travels from Bartica Office to the different locations by the Officers.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, we would like to provide as much information as would be useful to the Honourable Member, but this is house-to-house registration, I do not know how many times somebody may come and go to a particular house or a village. The

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

best estimation has been done here and I think this is adequate, but we would like to be able to help as much as possible.

**Mr Dave Danny:** Account Code 6293 ... *[Interruption]*

**The Chairman:** Honourable Members, we have to move on it is about five minutes before the hour

**Mr Dave Danny:** ... Refreshment and Meals - in 2007 it was \$2,150,000 and in 2008 there is an extravagant sum of \$8,730,000.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** As difficult as it may seem for me to answer this one, we have people working doing registrations all day house-to-house and they have to be paid and eat. So I am sure that people working late there are provisions for refreshment and meals. I am hoping that there is no suggestion that people should not have refreshment and meals during this activity, but in fact there was a request for \$65,000,000 and the actual sum provided is under \$9,000,000. There should be no quarrel with this.

**Agency 11 - Elections Commission, Programme 111 - Elections Commission - \$1,918,574,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates. The Chairperson:**

**The Chairman:** Pages 78 and 79 ...

**AGENCY 11 - ELECTIONS COMMISSION,  
Programme 112 - Elections Administration**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$784,958,000 for Agency 11, Programme 111 - Elections Administration - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6281- Security Services - Could the Honourable Minister indicate which building or buildings or installations or whatever will be serviced under this Code?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the Polling Stations will be secured and also the offices of the various Returning Officers in the various districts.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** The Minister just now spoke about being able to do things better and cheaper, when I asked on a previous head, but I noticed that last year only \$7,900,000, when we anticipated that there would be Local Government Elections; now we see an increase of \$20,000,000; is it that the Polling Stations which were identified, had we had elections last year, have tripled for this year when we anticipate we would have elections.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** The provisions last year for house-to-house registration and not for elections.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 11 - Elections Commission, Programme 112 - Elections Administration - \$784,958,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 435 ...

**AGENCY 11 - ELECTIONS COMMISSION - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$25,755,000 for Agency 11, Programme 111 - Elections Administration - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mr Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, would the Honourable Minister agree that there is a significant inconsistency between the project as identified in the Legend on Page 435 in the Estimates and the Project as defined in the Project Profile for this Capital item. Specifically my question is whether the Minister would agree that payment of retention is not consistent with purchase of furniture and equipment. It is not what it is for, but it is inconsistent with the Legend as defined in the Estimates.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the payment of the retention relates to the purchase of disc cutters for ID Cards. There was an inability to pay for all the needed disc cutters in 2007.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, my question to the Minister then would it not have been proper to have included in the Legend in the Estimates the fact of a retention for disc cutters since it would be misleading if you look at the Legend in the Estimates and simply accepted that.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** It would have helped.

**Agency 11 - Elections Commission - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$ 25,755,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 240 and 241 ...

**AGENCY 53 - GUYANA DEFENCE FORCE, Programme 531 - Defence Headquarters**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$4,350,446 for Agency 53 - Guyana Defence Force, Programme 531 - Defence Head quarters - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mrs Backer

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, just a slight query, Account Codes 6111 to 6115, we see monies being budgeted for and the Staffing Details is blank. I am just asking is this a matter of security, because once it is, of course we would not ask. I am asking that, Sir, in the background that I am aware that there are civilian

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

employees of the Guyana Defence Force and I am just wondering where we would find the staff if they are not here.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Minister Webster

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman that information cannot be provided in the interest of national security even though the sums are budgeted here.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** I under that Mr Chairman, but I am just asking being personally aware of the fact (I think everyone is aware) this is not a security issue now that there are many civilians who are employed by the Guyana Defence Force; I am asking why are they not here, because that cannot be a security issue, whether there are two telephone operators who are civilians or three people cutting cloth or something like that.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I am advised that the civilians fall within those same categories.

**The Chairman:** The civilians fall where?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Within the same categories.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Account Code 6302 - Training including Scholarships - Given the fact, Mde Minister, that we have heard that the new hierarchy of the Guyana Defence Force quite rightly indicated the training and significant training is needed and significant retraining is needed for their officers and soldiers, is the Minister satisfied that \$63,000,00 which is not a significant

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

increase from \$46,199,000 is sufficient to give us that training to bring our military fully into the 21<sup>st</sup> century?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, the answer is yes.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Danny

**Mr Dave Danny:** Sorry, Mr Chairman.

**Agency 53 - Guyana Defence Force, Programme 531 - Defence Headquarters - \$4,350,446 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 458 ...

**AGENCY 53 - GUYANA DEFENCE FORCE  
CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$699,000,000 for Agency 53 - Guyana Defence Force Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Mr Chairman, I am very conscious of security issues - Project Code 2800,100 - Pure Water Supply - we see a figure of \$9,000,000 for the construction of well and when we look at the Legend on Page 198 this project entails the construction of a well at Timehri, my question Sir, as we presently speak what

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

access to potable water does our military presently enjoy at Timehri in view of the fact that we are now talking about a well.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, in response to the question posed by the Honourable Member Mrs Backer, I would say that our military currently enjoy water supply by the Guyana Water Inc. and this well here is to boost the source of water supply to the base camp at Timehri.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Franklin

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** Could the Honourable Minister explain if this \$9,000,000 includes pumps, purification and the cost to drill a well in Timehri? Does it include all the ancillary pieces of equipment that are required? That seems extremely cheap that is why I asked the question.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman: The answer is no.

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** So, Mr Chairman, where is the money placed for the rest of the equipment to complete it? Where would that be?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I am advised that the sums budgeted here is to meet the cost of drilling the well.

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** Only?

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Yes.



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** Therefore you would not be able to have potable water supply until you get the other equipment and more money to finish it off.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I am also advised that there is already a distribution system in place at Timehri to support that well that would be drilled.

**Mrs Deborah J Backer:** Of course, with the usual caveat, under Project Code 5100200 - Equipment - we see a figure of \$550,000,000 and Legend on Page 201 tells us that the Project entails the purchase of machinery and equipment including helicopters, vehicles, computers and communications set. Is this figure an accurate figure given the fact that the Guyanese public have been told by His Excellency the President that just under \$1 billion will be provided this year for helicopters and seeing that this Code is only \$550,000,000, I was wonder if some figure was missing, perhaps a one should be in front of that 550. I am just asking, because we were told that \$1 billion will be provided.

**The Chairman:** This might be US. *[Laughter]*

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, I would like to clarify that the sum of \$1 billion has been budgeted to meet capital expenditure for the entire security services. It entails Prisons, Fire, Police and the GDF. The sum voted here Sir, \$550,000,000 will be utilised for the purchase of two helicopters and the supporting specialised equipment for those helicopters.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**The Chairman:** So that is accurate.

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** I remember asking a question some time ago about the cost of helicopters and I was told that the money allocated was far too small for a Bell Helicopter. In light of the fact that this provision caters for two helicopters, does it mean that we are moving away from Bell and if so we will have a complement of helicopters of various types which is as the maintenance people know is not very efficient for the maintenance.

**Hon Jennifer I Webster:** Mr Chairman, we are not moving away from Bell Helicopters. We are all well aware that it would not be in the best interest of the Force to not have equipment that is compatible. We are purchasing a different type of Bell Helicopter. I think the one that Mr Franklin referred to was the Bell 412; we are purchasing Bell 206 Helicopters.

**Agency 53 - Guyana Defence Force - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$699,000,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Honourable Members, for the rest of the Agencies 57, 58, 02, 07, 08, I will just all them, put the questions, have them approved, without allowing any questions, because the time is up. The time has long passed.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman, I find this a little bit disturbing and this time, because I am sure I raised the issue in our meeting that where we are not completed that there should be some flexibility, because there are going to be some items on which we will save time. I noticed the report stated the items that we would save time without referring to the items on which we are not going to save time and I think it is not satisfactory that we will not be able to complete items that maybe controversial and where we save time we agreed that we will use that saved time for something else. I hope, Sir, that that is not the kind of approach that we will have, because this is a very long list of items for the period of two hours.

**The Chairman:** Honourable Member, you raised the question and that was all that you did. The National Assembly has voted on this Resolution here and voted only yesterday. Are you recommending to me as Speaker of the National Assembly that I ignore it? If that is your suggestion that I ignore it ... *[Interruption]*

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Sir, I believe that in fairness to ... *[Interruption]*

**The Chairman:** This has nothing to do with fairness. We sat here, deliberated, passed a Resolution and now you are asking me to ignore it. How can you asked that, Honourable Member?

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Sir, we did not deliberately ignore the Resolution. The point is, in the meeting that we had yesterday in your Office, I raised the question

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

what will happen in a case where we have not completed the items and therefore we should in fact exercise some flexibility. I got the impression that there was some understanding on that matter, because we are likely to be saving time on some other items. Therefore, if you are saying that you are going to truncate the discussion, because you have allocated two hours for a long list of items, I have a problem with that.

**The Chairman:** Mr Carberry, how can you accuse me of being a dictator, when this National Assembly sat here, passed this Resolution unanimously, now you are asking me to ignore it. If what you want me to do, speak to your Members on the opposite side. I am flexible on all of these things, but you cannot sit there and ask me to ignore a Resolution passed by the House. What kind of absurdity is that, I am hearing here today?

**Mr Winston S Murray:** May I, Sir?

**The Chairman:** Mr Murray, I warn you more than half an hour ago that time is going that we will not be able to finish this item. I warned you that we will not be able to finish it. What would you like me to do?

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman,... *[Interruption]*

**The Chairman:** I have never heard of this before. I know that I am here only six years as a Speaker, but this is all new to me.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** I wish un-apologetically to say that we regret the fact that you interpret what has been

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

said by my colleague to ignore the Resolution by the National Assembly. We intended no such thing, Sir, nor are we entitled so to do and we take your advise that this is a discussion between the Whips and the flexibility should be found at that level, but that as Chairman, you have to comply with the Resolution that we passed. So I want to say that to you, to set your heat at ease Sir, that we do not intend to challenge you on that, Sir, because we understand that your role is to comply.

Now Sir, is it possible that we should agree that should we save time that we should come back to raise questions on these? Could we leave them alone?

**The Chairman:** Mr Murray, I am amenable to any single thing in this National Assembly providing the parties agree. I am at your complete and total disposal and have always been.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Yes Sir and I know that. So my proposal, Sir, since the time is up is that we go the other items and at the end of the time, once we see there is time we can come back and deal with them. That seems to be the alternative.

**The Chairman:** I have no objection to that.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Thank you, Sir. Well let us go on to the other items and then come back.

**Hon Dr Leslie S Ramsammy:** Mr Chairman, I just want for the records that we are going with the Resolution.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**The Chairman:** Let us proceed with Pages 128 and 129

...

**AGENCY 31 - MINISTRY OF PUBLIC WORKS AND COMMUNICATIONS, Programme 311 - Ministry Administration**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$209,065,000 for Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications, Programme 311 - Ministry Administration - stands part of the Estimates.

**Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications, Programme 311 - Ministry Administration - \$209,065,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 130 and 131 ...

**AGENCY 31 - MINISTRY OF PUBLIC WORKS AND COMMUNICATIONS, Programme 312 - Public Works**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$362,710,000 for Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications, Programme 312 - Public Works - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mrs Riehl

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I wish to ask about the authorised strength from Account Codes 6111 to 6115 - Administrative, Senior Technical, Other Technical and Craft Skilled, Clerical and Office Support and Senior Technical and Unskilled.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the total authorised strength is thirty-seven.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Honourable Minister, can you give me a breakdown under the various Codes? Which categories? You have twenty-filled vacancies and you said the authorised strength is thirty-seven; could you please tell us under which Codes you have shortage of staff?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Sorry, Mr Chairman and Honourable Members; the authorised strength is in fact sixty-one. We do not have the breakdown immediately.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Could you undertake to supply it please?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Yes

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Thank you.

**Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications, Programme 312 - Public Works - \$362,710,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 132 and 133 ...

**AGENCY 31 - MINISTRY OF PUBLIC WORKS AND COMMUNICATIONS, Programme 313 - Communication and Transport**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$41,429,000 for Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications, Programme 313 - Ministry Administration - stands part of the Estimates.

**Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications, Programme 313 - Communication and Transport - \$41,429,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

Pages 443, 444 and 445 ...

**AGENCY 31 - MINISTRY OF PUBLIC WORKS - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE -Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$8,048,686,000 for Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mr Murray



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, I would like to address Project Code 1400300 -Dredging - Equipment - the Legend for which reads docking of dredge Steve 'N', ML Thompson and purchase of spares. Mr Minister, when I take account of that Legend together with what is in the Project Profile, am I to understand that no repair work is going to be undertaken on these dredges and that they simply docked and spares being acquired during 2008?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the amount reflects the docking of the Steve N and the dredging of the ML Thompson and the acquisition of spares. They are normal running repairs which are affected as you go from time to time, but docking is what it is; you put the vessel in a dock yard and you do major structural and other repairs to the hull and superstructure of the vessel. You cannot repair a hull at sea or on water or on the way.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, I do not think it requires the Minister to insult my intelligence, because what he writes here simply says that he is going to dock and if he is going to dock, I have no way of knowing that that includes repairs and I am asking him to explain whether this is simply to dock and acquire spares or is also to dock, acquire spares and fix. It is very simple.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I am sorry if the Honourable Member thought that I was attempting to insult him, I would not attempt to do so. You can put a vessel in dock and not do anything to it, *[Laughter]* but

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

when you do docking, the purpose of docking and I said it, is doing major structural repairs, replacement to the Hull and to the superstructure of a vessel. I did say also that you would do normal running repairs while the vessel is working or underway, but a docking, the term itself reflects major repairs to the hull of a vessel without which it will sink.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** How would I know that I am no expert?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I explained, Sir, but you interpreted my explanation to mean that I was attempting to insult you. I was trying to explain.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Minister, would it then be accurate to say the sum of \$110,000,000 includes the structural rehabilitation of these vessels and everything is included in this sum?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, if I give a breakdown of the \$110,000,000, it refers to:

- \$20,000,000 for Stephen;
- \$35,000,000 for the docking of the ML Thompson;  
and
- \$55,000,000 for the acquisition of spares.

These would includes some running spares, but basically for the bulk of the equipment which would be installed or in terms of the replacement at the time of docking.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Thank you.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I wish to ask the Honourable Minister \$20,000,000 allocated for Bartica/Isaano/Mahdia Road; the Legend says it is for roads and structures - what sort of structures are part of the rehabilitated pieces?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the structures refer to the installation of bridges or culverts. Those are the normal pieces.

**Mr Judith David-Blair:** Mr Chairman, the same Project Code - when you look at Page 92 in the Project Profile, it says clearly here that this project entails rehabilitation of critical structure and sections of roads between One to Five Miles Bartica and you have here Project Code 14015000 Bartica/Isaano/Mahdia Road - can the Minister say what part of Isaano Road and what part of Mahdia Road and how will this be done, because One to Five Miles is One to Five Miles Bartica and Isaano is further down and Mahdai is further down.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the Bartica Potaro Road or the road as referred to in our description is the entire length of the road. We specify the portion of the road that we are addressing this year - one to Five Miles - the critical sections. We were not referring by any means to the Isaano end not the Mahdia end, but we did specify the One-to Five Miles portion.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mrs Judith David-Blair:** Can the Minister say if this is the \$20,000,000 that was promised in 2007 and was not used or has this been brought forward or is this a new representation intended to do with the 2007 allocation.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, I think we did spend \$6,000,000, whether the availability of materials created problems in doing the road and also issues of a contractor to do the roads; \$6,000,000 were spent in acquiring materials and we are spending \$20,000,000 this year to complete that road. So in total at the end of the day with respect to this project \$26,000,000 would have been spent.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I wish to ask under Project Code 1401900 - Urban Roads and Drainage - Rehabilitation of roads in Georgetown, New Amsterdam and Rose Hall - which roads in Georgetown are meant to be captured in this \$200,000,000?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the sum referred to urban roads throughout the country - Georgetown, New Amsterdam, Rose Hall, Corriverton and Linden; \$32,000,000 reflect roll over from last year and \$168,000,000 will be spent this year. Some thirty-two miles of declared public roads would be addressed in Georgetown

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** A supplementary question - the question is asked specifically which roads in Georgetown?

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, it may have been noticed that we have been supporting the Georgetown Municipality, the Mayor and City Council with extensive road works in Georgetown even at this time. In terms of the specifics of all roads on a prioritised basis, I do not think that we have a final list. This is being worked on, but the roads are dealt with even as we speak.

**Agency 31 - Ministry of Public Works and Communications - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$8,048,686,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**16:30H**

**The Chairman:** Honourable Members, this item has been finished in half an hour. If the Honourable Members wish, if our staff have stopped the people from leaving, I propose ...

Pages 254 and 255 ...

I believe this person has left; I am not too sure, so you might not be able to get any answers.

**AGENCY 57 - OFFICE OF THE OMBUDSMAN,  
Programme 571 - Ombudsman**

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$12,583,000 for Agency 57 - Office of the Ombudsman, Programme 571 - Ombudsman - stands part of the Estimates.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** I will try. Mr Chairman, could you repeat the page numbers.

**The Chairman:** Pages 254 and 255 - Office of the Ombudsman.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I see a budgeted sum of \$12,583,000 here, I wish to ask the Honourable Minister whoever is going to answer whether this means that we are going to have an Ombudsman after an absence of five/six years. With the post being vacant whether this \$12,583,000 budgeted here means that we are going to have an Ombudsman, because last year there was \$3,000,000 actually used last year. So I wish to ask whether an Ombudsman is going to be appointed.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Minister Benn

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the provision has been made for and the intention is to have an Ombudsman appointed.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Carberry

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman, in the Staffing Details - COA 6116 - I note it identifies one contracted employee and in the details there is no provision under COA 6116 in the 2008 budget. Is it that they do not expect to employ this one contracted employee in 2008?

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the person is no longer employed by the Office of the Ombudsman.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** A follow-up Sir, why then is the one contracted employee still in the Staffing Details? Why did you put it back? Is that an oversight?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** At the time when the Budget was prepared, the person was in position.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Is the Minister then saying we should delete this position from the filled column?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** There is an intention to fill the position.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Sir, this is a contradictory answer by the Minister. He just said that it is not filled at the moment, so it could be on the establishment and not filled.

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I think I did say that there was a person at the time when the Budget was prepared; that person has left and there is still an intention to fill the position.

**Agency 57 - Office of the Ombudsman, Programme 571 - Ombudsman - \$12,583,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 258 and 259 ...

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**  
**AGENCY 58 - PUBLIC SERVICE APPELLATE**  
**TRIBUNAL, Programme 581 - Public Service**  
**Appellate Tribunal**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$18,484,000 for Agency 58 - Public Service Appellate Tribunal, Programme 581 - Public Service Appellate Tribunal - stands part of the Estimates.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I would like to ask who are the two contracted employees in the Public Service Appellate Tribunal; what functionary and what position?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, the two contracted employees referred to is a Registrar and a Confidential Secretary.

**Agency 58 - Public Service Appellate Tribunal, Programme 581 - Public Service Appellate Tribunal - \$ 18,484,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 462 ...

**AGENCY 58 - PUBLIC SERVICE APPELLATE**  
**TRIBUNAL - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency**  
**Totals**



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$3,500,000 for Agency 58 - Public Service Appellate Tribunal - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates

**Agency 58 - Public Service Appellate Tribunal - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$3,500,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 40 and 41 ...

**AGENCY 02 - OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER, Programme 021 - Prime Minister's Secretariat**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$ 127,505,000 for Agency 02 - Office of the Prime Minister, Programme 021 - Prime Minister's Secretariat - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mr Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister identify the categories of contracted employees and their remuneration since the contracted employees seem to be the only employees that there are except for some clerical and semi-skilled operatives?

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, there are eight contracted employees. They relate to:

- A PAS
- Two Special Assistants
- Two Assistants to the Prime Minister
- A Secretary/Typist
- A Supervisor of Household and
- An Assistant Supervisor

In terms of the details of remuneration, we do not have that level of detail here at the moment, but it can be provided.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, the question I asked in the other agencies is highly relevant here. Could the Minister explain why it was not possible and preferable to appoint Secretary/Typists in the traditional Public Service rather than have them recruited as contracted employees?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, this is the Prime Minister's Office and I really cannot speak to any specific preference here, but I think this is what could have been done and this is what they found to be viable.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 02 - Office of the Prime Minister, Programme 021 - Prime Minister's Secretariat - \$127,505,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 427 ...

**AGENCY 02 - OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER  
- CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$5,052, 500,000 for Agency 02 - Office of the Prime Minister - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

The Honourable Member Mr Winston S Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister explain to the National Assembly whether having spent \$5,000,000,000 in 2008 on providing electrification to un-served areas, is it within the programme of the GPL to recover in its general electricity charges rates this sum of money over time or is it a subsidy?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, this is a subsidy to the GPL and customers too for the transmission and distribution works.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Would it be correct to say that we will not see an increase in electricity rates on the basis

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

of this expenditure or similar expenditures for electrification?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Electricity rates are separate issues in the GPL and relate more to the cost of operations.

**Mr Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I see \$6,000,000 budgeted here for minor works under Project Code 1701000 and the Capital Profile speaks of improved living conditions of vulnerable groups. The project entails implementation of minor project and programmes, and the benefits are to improve living conditions of vulnerable groups. Could the Honourable Minister shed some light on what this \$6,000,000 is really for?

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** Mr Chairman, this is basically help for various communities on appeals when there are difficulties with respect to minor works they may have in the communities. I think for equipment; some time there was a tractor/trailer bought for Kwakwani and issues like that - minor works.

**Agency 02 - Office of the Prime Minister - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$5,052,500,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 60 and 61 ...

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**  
**AGENCY 07 - PARLIAMENT OFFICE, Programme**  
**071 - National Assembly**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$783,154,000 for Agency 07 - Parliament Office, Programme 071 - National Assembly - stands part of the Estimates

I am told they have confidence in the Speaker.

**Agency 07 - Parliament Office, Programme 071 - National Assembly - \$ 783,154,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Are you on the Audit Office, Sir?

**The Chairman:** Not as yet.

Page 431 ...

**AGENCY 07 - PARLIAMENT OFFICE - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals** Question is proposed that the sum of \$9,000,000 for Agency 07 - Parliament Office, Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 07 - Parliament Office - Capital Expenditure  
- Agency Totals - \$9,000,000 - agreed to and ordered  
to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 432 ...

**AGENCY 08 - AUDIT OFFICE - CAPITAL  
EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$46,792,000 for Agency 08 - Audit Office - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

The only item under the Audit Office is Capital expenditure.

The Honourable Member Mr Carberry

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** Mr Chairman, we note that Project Code 4401000 - Institutional Strengthening - when you read the Legend on Page 39 in Volume 3, it says the Project includes the purchase of photocopier, chairs, computer work station and stabilizer; I assume that since it says includes, it means that there are some other items included there and is it possible for one to be told what are the items not listed there? [*Interruption: 'Page 38'*]

**Hon BH Robeson Benn:** I am not sure which page the Honourable Member is reading from.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** I am sorry about that Sir; it is my mistake. I looked at Page 39 instead of Page 38. I read the wrong item.

**Agency 08 - Audit Office - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$46,792,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Honourable Members, that concludes our business for this session. We have forty-five minutes remaining for tea and I recommend that we occupy the full time, because it is a little bit less than we had over the past few days. So I think this is a good time to suspend until 17:30h

**Assembly Resumed**

**16:43H - SUSPENSION OF SITTING**

**17:38H - RESUMPTION OF SITTING**

**Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply and resumed consideration of the Estimates of Expenditure for 2008**

**IN COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY**

Page 438

**AGENCY 15 - MINISTRY OF FOREIGN TRADE  
AND INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION -  
CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$4,500,000 for Agency 15 - Ministry of Foreign Trade and International Co-operation - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates

**Agency 15 - Ministry of Foreign Trade and  
International Co-operation - Capital Expenditure -  
\$4,500,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the  
Estimates.**

Pages 52 and 53 ...

**AGENCY 04 - MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS,  
Programme 041 - Ministry Administration**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$731,515,000 for Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs Programme 041 - Ministry Administration - stands part of the Estimates



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Mr Norton is not here. The Honourable Member Mr Winston S Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister kindly indicate to the National Assembly what is the authorised strength for Account Codes 6111, 6112, 6113, 6114 and 6115. Could the Honourable Minister provide the details of the eleven contracted employees in terms of their positions in the Ministry and their remuneration?

The Honourable Minister Nadir

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Chairman, with respect to the authorised strength for:

- Account Code 6111 - sixty-three
- Account Code 6112 - three
- Account Code 6113 - three
- Account Code 6114 - forty-five and
- Account Code 6115 - eighteen

In terms of the contracted employees we have:

- Director General - \$334,000
- The Head EPMU - \$320,000
- Advisor on Personal  
Matters - \$120,000
- Three Drivers - \$40,000

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Four Protocol Officers - \$44,000 each  
and
- Handy Person - \$33,000

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Murray

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Thank you Mr Minister. Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister indicate whether he intends to fill these vacancies ... Well, first of all I should ask a question ... Among the administrative number of sixty-three persons authorised, are career diplomats included among them and if they are not included there in which of the categories are they included?

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Chairman, with respect to the number of career diplomats and if they are included there, we will have to provide that, because the answer is actually is yes they are.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** And if they are, Mr Minister, could you indicate to the National Assembly whether in the year 2008 there is any intention of filling important vacancies which exists in some of our missions overseas, in particular I have in mind the permanent representative to the United Nations position, but that is only one and the Ambassador to China is two?

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Chairman, with respect to the particular Head we are looking at is administration and here we deal with the staff at home. The next programme deals with the overseas filling, but I know only recently

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

(just two weeks ago) I saw some appointments that came through the Public Service Ministry dealing with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. So I know from what I have seen there is an intention of addressing some of the issues raised by the Honourable Member.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** If I ask you there is because I got the impression when I answered the first time round that the career diplomats were included in the administrative categories. So that is an error born out of that situation, but I notice that you did not address my specific question; you do not have to answer, I know, but maybe perchance you unintentionally missed it, where I was asking whether there is any intention during 2008 to fill the vacancy at the United Nations where we do not have a permanent representative and I think the Minister in his presentation pointed out, there are many important things going on now at the United Nations and whether, we should not be contemplating filling that vacancy. The other one is the ambassadorship to China, whether we should not consider filling that and whether there is any intention or plan during 2008 at least to fill those two key vacancies.

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Chairman, noting that the questions relate to the second head, I had declined to provide the answer now, however, when we look at the second head, you will see under several of the categories especially where we look at postage, there was an under-spending last year and this year we are providing the resources to allow for the rotation of staff and the

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

appointment of new staff. There are about fifteen persons who in 2008 will be posted overseas.

**Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Programme 041 - Ministry Administration \$731,515,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 54 and 55 ...

**AGENCY 04 - MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS, Programme 042 - Foreign Relations**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$1,572,022,000 for Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs Programme 042 - Foreign Relations - stands part of the Estimates

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Again Mr Chairman, with your indulgence I would like if the Minister could inform the National Assembly of the authorised strength in the various categories 6111 through 6115 and 6117; then also in relation to contracted employees the positions and their remunerations. We have the numbers in the Estimates actually.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Minister

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Account Code 6111 the authorised strength is 78; Account Code 6113 the authorised strength is 23;

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Account Code 6113 not 6112?

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** No. We have zero. Account Code 6114 the authorised strength is 66; Account Code 6115 the authorised strength is 55. In terms of some of some of the conditions under the contracted employees, there are thirteen right now, which also included the position of

- Consul General New York;
- The Permanent Representative in New York;
- The Deputy Consul General New York,;
- Ambassador to Brazil;
- High Commissioner to India;
- Trade Officer Toronto;
- High Commissioner to Ottawa;
- High Commissioner to London;
- Ambassador in Brussels;
- Ambassador in Suriname;
- Ambassador in Caracas;
- Ambassador in Cuba; and
- Ambassador in Washington

**The Chairman:** Mr Murray

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Thank you Mr Minister and now perhaps is the time when you would like to address the earlier questions I raised.

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Chairman, with respect to the United Nations, Minister Insanally is still the designated Permanent Representative to the UN and the other positions are under active consideration.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman through you Sir, and this is really a genuine question out of concern; with the greatest of respect to Minister Insanally who is a tower of strength in many regards to the Foreign Service; do you really think that we are doing justice to Guyana to ask someone who is a fulltime Minister carrying the responsibilities of the entire Ministry of Foreign Affairs to also be our permanent representative at the United Nations which requires a very action and prolonged presence and involvement in what goes on?

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Chairman, you will now agree with me that we are now venturing into something that we should have done during the last few days we sat here and I thought that the Estimates, the questions pertaining to numbers appearing with respect to the particular heads here, but the issues raised by the Honourable Member Mr Murray, I am confident that they are coming from the depth of truth and honesty in his heart and I want to say from that same depth from this side that those matters are under active consideration.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Programme  
042 - Foreign Relations**

**\$1,572,022,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part  
of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 56 and 57 ...

**AGENCY 04 - MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS,  
Programme 043 - Foreign Trade and International  
Co-operation**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$91,753,000 for  
Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs Programme 043  
- Foreign Trade and International Co-operation - stands  
part of the Estimates

**The Chairman:** Mr Murray.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Sir, when we did the Ministry  
of Foreign Affairs just now, I stand corrected and I would  
accept your ruling, did we do the capital expenditure?

**The Chairman:** For what?

**Mr Winston S Murray:** For the Ministry of Foreign  
Affairs, Sir.

**The Chairman:** No, we are still at Programme 043, we  
have to do the capital expenditure for the Ministry of  
Foreign Affairs.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Oh yes.

**The Chairman:** This is Foreign Trade and International Co-operation; I presume there is no question.

**Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Programme 043 - Foreign Trade and International Cooperation - \$91,753,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Page 430

**AGENCY 04 - MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$23,887,000 for Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs - Capital Expenditure -Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates

**Agency 04 - Ministry of Foreign Affairs Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals**

**\$23,887,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**



**The Chairman:** Pages 156 and 157

**AGENCY 44 - MINISTRY OF CULTURE, YOUTH AND SPORT, Programme 441 - Ministry Administration**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$ 145,325,000 for Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport, Programme 441 - Ministry Administration - stands part of the Estimates

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Could the Honourable Minister tell this National Assembly of the authorised strength in each of the category 6111 to 6115 and could he tell us what are the positions held by the various categories of contracted employees and the remuneration in each category?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** Mr Chairman, the authorised strength is:

- Administrative - 3
- Other Technical and Craft Skilled - 6
- Clerical and Office Support - 26
- Semi-Skilled Operatives and Unskilled - 4

and for the

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Contracted Employees - 42

|   |             |
|---|-------------|
| Salaries of four vehicle drivers        | - \$54,500  |
| A Personal Assistant to the Minister    | - \$122,000 |
| Permanent Secretary                     | - \$378,000 |
| 3 Assistant Accountants @               | - \$62,000  |
| Accounts Clerk II                       | - \$49,000  |
| Accounts Clerk I                        | - \$50,000  |
| Typist Clerk I                          | - \$51,000  |
| Principal Assistant Secretary (Finance) | - \$120,000 |
| An Accountant                           | - \$100,000 |
| Personnel Officer I                     | - \$70,000  |
| Typist Clerk III                        | - \$62,000  |
| Typist Clerk I                          | - \$31,000  |
| Painter                                 | - \$49,000  |
| Cleaner                                 | - \$28,000  |
| Internal Security                       | - \$46,000  |
| Supervisor of CARIFESTA Complex         | - \$68,000  |
| A Stock Verifier                        | - \$50,000  |
| Another Typist I                        | - \$50,000  |

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

|                             |                |
|-----------------------------|----------------|
| Superintendent of Works II  | - \$99,000     |
| Electrician                 | - \$49,000     |
| Supervisor of Food Services | - \$62,000     |
| Canteen Attendant           | - \$39,000     |
| Electrician                 | - \$33,000     |
| Senior Groundsman           | - \$62,000     |
| Supply Officer              | - \$109,000    |
| Supply Expediter II         | - \$64,000     |
| Registry Supervisor         | - \$49,000     |
| Inspecting Officer          | - \$101,000    |
| Storekeeper II              | - \$46,000     |
| Programme Assistant         | - \$38,000 and |
| Another Typist I            | - \$33,000     |

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Just a second please?

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, I would like to ask the Honourable Minister what is the rationale of having all of these persons - Assistant Accountants, Typists and all of these people under contract rather in the main stream - public service? What rationale you use to have this huge number of contracted employees to run the Ministry.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon Frank CS Anthony:** The persons have opted for this type of employment and so we have entered in such an agreement with them.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Minister, do you also have accountants within the Ministry as part of the Public Service structure, because I note at the back that in fact you have under Agency 44 , Programme 1, you do have accountants there; do you in fact pay them therefore differential salaries? That is what this information reveals.

**Hon Frank CS Anthony:** Yes, we do have an accountant on public service scale.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Yes, but my further question was, I noted that, from the figures, but that is revealed at the back of the Estimates that you do have, that you are also paying them differential salaries and emoluments. That is my question; are you acknowledging that? Now that is what this information shows.

**Hon Frank CS Anthony:** Well, I would not be able to answer you whether there is a differential at this point.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Minister, would you please provide that information so that we could see whether there is a differential? Could you kindly provide that information formally to me?

**Hon Frank CS Anthony:** Yes, we can provide that information to you.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport, Programme 441 - Ministry Administration - \$145,325,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 158 and 159 ...

**AGENCY 44 - MINISTRY OF CULTURE, YOUTH AND SPORT, Programme 442 -Culture**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$518,466,000 for Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture Youth and Sport, Programme 442 - Culture - stands part of the Estimates

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Sir, may I respectfully ask the Minister to provide me again with the information as to the authorised strength in the respective categories? I do not want to waste time in repeating them and indeed the same information as requested for contracted employees.

**Hon Frank CS Anthony:** The authorised strength is those that are listed in the Estimates on Page 159 as filled and for the contracted employees there are thirty-one and I can go through that list again. They are:

|                            |            |
|----------------------------|------------|
| A Public Relations Officer | - \$74,000 |
| Instructor II              | - \$84,000 |

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

|                            |             |
|----------------------------|-------------|
| Confidential Secretary     | - \$51,000  |
| Administrator              | - \$131,000 |
| Instructor I               | - \$77,000  |
| Instructor II              | - \$121,000 |
| Director of Studies        | - \$115,000 |
| Cleaner                    | - \$28,000  |
| Secretary/Registrar        | - \$47,000  |
| Administrative Manager     | - \$97,000  |
| Senior Light Operator      | - \$51,000  |
| Chief Usher                | - \$51,000  |
| Maintenance Assistant      | - \$39,000  |
| Sound Operator II          | - \$33,000  |
| Internal Security          | - \$47,000  |
| Senior Assistant Archivist | - \$95,000  |
| Micrographic Supervisor    | - \$112,000 |
| Librarian                  | - \$51,000  |
| Special Project Officer    | - \$124,000 |
| Special Project Officer    | - \$74,000  |
| Programme Assistant        | - \$66,000  |
| System Analyst             | - \$95,000  |

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

|                                       |                |
|---------------------------------------|----------------|
| Sound Operator                        | - \$33,000     |
| Micrographic Technician               | - \$74,000     |
| Anthropological Assistant             | - \$47,000 and |
| Instructor, Burrowes School<br>of Art | - \$84,000     |

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, through you, Mr Minister you identified Confidential Secretary as a category under contracted employees; you also Mr Minister, don't you, have a Confidential Secretary category in the traditional public service, could you inform this National Assembly:

(a) Why was it not possible and proper to appoint the Confidential Secretary you have put under contracted employee within the traditional public service? That is the first question?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** The person opted for the arrangement of being a contracted employee.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, through you Sir, Mr Minister whether a person opts, does it not depend on the approach taken by the Ministry? Is it not the Ministry who invites applications and either fills them through the public service or fills them under contract and it is the Ministry therefore which opted to go this route, because the person cannot opt unless you put that as an option.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** Well there is a choice and the person opted to go in a direction of being a contracted employee and they do not have security of tenure. So that is their arrangement; they would like to be a contracted employee.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Minister is it not true that the person only have a choice, because you put a choice in your scheme of things. Had you chosen to employ under the traditional public service then that would have been done? Isn't that not so? *[Pause]* Well, the Minister cannot get up; he is pinned to his seat.

Mr Minister, what the information reveals, is that there is a differential in the levels of remuneration for identical positions as between contracted employees and public employees; and is it not true that while a contracted employee does not get a pension, he or she gets a 22½ percent gratuity, which has a greater immediacy and better appeal to such a person.

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** I think that you answered the question yourself that there is a 22½ percent gratuity and that is why you will have a differential.

**Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport,  
Programme 442 - Culture \$518,466,000 - agreed to  
and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**The Chairman:** Pages 160 and 161

**AGENCY 44 - MINISTRY OF CULTURE, YOUTH AND SPORT, Programme 443 - Youth**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$306,414,000 for Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture Youth and Sport, Programme 443 - Youth - stands part of the Estimates

**Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport, Programme 443 - Youth \$306,414,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 162 and 163

**AGENCY 44 - MINISTRY OF CULTURE, YOUTH AND SPORT, Programme 444 - Sport**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$ 128,181,000 for Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture Youth and Sport, Programme 444 - Sport - stands part of the Estimates

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Dr Norton

**Dr George A Norton:** Mr Chairman, under Account Code 6116 - could the Honourable Minister state the

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

number of contracted employees and the categories of the area of sports?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** Under that Account Code these are persons who are employed at the Guyana National Stadium and they are eleven persons...

**Mr E Lance Carberry:** ... 6116 and the table entitled Staffing Details; there is a contradiction there, because there is a zero beside contracted employees.

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** All these persons are under the National Sports Commission and they are not listed here as you have pointed out, but I am just giving you the sum of money that you have there \$8,972,000 are for eleven people at the Stadium.

**Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport, Programme 444 - Sport \$128,181,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Page 449

**AGENCY 44 - MINISTRY OF CULTURE, YOUTH AND SPORT - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$ 643,000,000 for Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture Youth and Sport -

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Capital Expenditure - Expenditure - stands part of the Estimates

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Patterson

**Mr David Patterson:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 4501800, I note in the Project Profile that there is a construction of a swimming pool; rehabilitation of Cliff Anderson Sports Hall and purchase of vehicle; can the Honourable Minister sub divide those sums? How much is allocated for the pool, Cliff Anderson and the vehicles?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** Under that Project Code there are:

|   |               |
|---|---------------|
| The National Sports Commission                                    | \$259,000,000 |
| Construction of the pool  | \$234,500,000 |
| Rehabilitation and<br>construction works at<br>the Cliff Anderson | \$5,000,000   |
| Rehabilitation and electrical<br>works at the Gymnasium           | \$5,000,000   |
| Colgrain Pool   | \$2,500,000   |
| Purchase of a vehicle   | \$6,000,000   |
| Sports Gears and Equipment  | \$6,000,000   |

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Dr Norton

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Dr George A Norton:** Mr Chairman, under the same National Sports Commission, with the \$5,000,000 that was earmarked for the rehabilitation of the Cliff Anderson Sports Hall, in the Project Profile you have rehabilitation of roof, is the reason why the floor which is needed of repairs is not listed here, because the \$5,000,000 will not suffice?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** Actually we did the floor last year; so the floor is currently okay. So the \$5,000,000 that is budgeted here is to do the lights for the Cliff Anderson Sports Hall.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Williams.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Mr Chairman, under Project Code 1800100 would the Honourable Minister be kind enough to advise as to how much of that sum relates to the construction of new buildings and how much of the sum relates to the rehabilitates of buildings?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** Is that the category dealing with youths?

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Yes, Sir

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** For the male dormitory at Madewini, we will be spending \$7,000,000 on the dorm. We will also be constructing a fence; we will be buying some double bunks bed frames and that would cost a total of \$8.815 million. We will also be doing works at the Brickdam Youth Centre and we will be spending \$1.185 million and the rest of the money, we will be using that to

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

buy training materials and sports gears for the Kuru Kuru Training College, the New Opportunity Corps, the Sophia Training Centre and the Smyth Field Training Centre.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 1800200 - CARIFESTA - \$305,000,000 - Could the Honourable Minister kindly inform this National Assembly whether the facilities to be upgraded are all State facilitates or are there private facilities included in that upgrade?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** They are all State facilities.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 4501700 - National Archives - would the Honourable Minister state what kind of archival supplies are envisaged in this purchase?

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** The archival materials are the following

- Binding materials;
- Acid free boxes and cardboards;
- Wrapping paper;
- Encapsulation materials;
- Micro Film; and
- Accessories.

**The Chairman:** The Honourable Member Mr Franklin

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** I will just go back quickly to Project Code 4501800 - National Sports Commission - I understand the Minister said that the flooring was fixed last year, but this year we have to do lighting and the roof. One of the reasons for the floor being damaged is because the roof was leaking, so why would one fix the floor before doing the roof? That is the question.

**The Chairman:** Shouldn't it be the opposite way around? You fix the roof, stop the leaking and then ...  
*[Interruption]*

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** That is the point, the floor was fixed last year.

**The Chairman:** Oh, you are saying that the floor was fixed last year.

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** Yes.

**Hon Dr Frank CS Anthony:** We are very cognisant that if you get rain coming through the roof, it could damage the floor and therefore at the time there were some minor leakages and those were fixed as well last year.

**Mr Everall N Franklin:** Well, I must accept that answer as being a final answer from the Minister.

**Agency 44 - Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport - Capital Expenditure \$643,000,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Can we move now to the next Agency?

Pages 140 and 141

**AGENCY 41 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION,  
Programme 411 - Main Office**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$339,773,000 for Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 411 - Main Office - stands part of the Estimates.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6116 - Contracted Employees - Could the Minister say what sections in the Ministry of Education are these employees working and what is their unit remuneration as per month?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** The contracted employees are employed at the Main Office - the two Ministers' Offices and the Permanent Secretaries.

**Mr Amna Ally:** How many?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** We have nine. The categories would be:

- The Permanent Secretary;
- The Secretary General of the National Commission for UNESCO;
- The Ministers' Personal Assistants; and

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Confidential Secretaries

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, supplementary question - I see eleven here; I heard the Minister say nine, but apart from that could the Minister say why these employees are not on the traditional establishment? What is the rationale used?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Well it depends on the persons who are interested in these appointments and to work with the Ministers. It is reciprocal, special expertise and so on.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Codes 6284 and 6294 - Other - I wonder if the Minister can tell us what items are hidden under those two?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** This would be other services.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Like What? What other services are included?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Like cleaning of the compound; gardening services - taking care of the plants; we like an aesthetic environment, drainage works and so on.

**Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 411 - Main Office - \$339,773,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates.**

**The Chairman:** Pages 142 and 143



**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**AGENCY 41 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION,  
Programme 412 - National Education Policy -  
Implementation and Supervision**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$96, 247,000 for Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 412 - National Education Policy - Implementation and Supervision - stands part of the Estimates.

**Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 412 -  
National Education Policy - Implementation and  
Supervision - \$96,247,000 - agreed to and ordered to  
stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 144 and 145

**AGENCY 41 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION,  
Programme 413 - Ministry Administration**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$846,276,000 for Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 413 - Ministry Administration - stands part of the Estimates.

**Ms Anna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6116- Contracted Employees - the Staffing Details illustrate an increase by four. Could the Minister say which sections do these contracted employees service.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** These contracted employees are in the Examinations Division of the Ministry of Education and in the Planning Department of the Ministry of Education.

**Ms Amna Ally:** A supplementary question - Mr Minister, could you say what is the remuneration of each of these employees?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** I can provide you with that list. It is a very large number and I did not walk with the list, but I can submit the list of the remuneration.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6114 - Clerical and Office Support - the Staffing Details illustrate a reduction from 102 to 93; could the Minister say what is the reason for this reduction?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** It is the rationalisation of staffing, greater efficiency and so on.

**Ms Amna Ally:** A supplementary question - Is there any vacancy in this section, Mr Minister?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** You have here the authorised staffing as laid down in the Schedule here.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** I am not quite sure I follow ... Is the Minister saying that the authorised strength is the same as in the column for 2008 that is marked filled? Is that what you are saying?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Yes, I am saying that.

**Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 413 - Ministry Administration - \$846,276,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 146 and 147

**AGENCY 41 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION, Programme 414 - Training and Development**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$570,796,000 for Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 414 - Training and Development - stands part of the Estimates.

**Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 415 - Training and Development - \$570,796,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Pages 148 and 149

**AGENCY 41 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION, Programme 415 - Education Delivery**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$3,942,280,000 for Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 415 - Education Delivery - stands part of the Estimates.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6116 - Contracted Employees - I wish to ask the Honourable Minister what area in the delivery of education are these contracted employees attached to.

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** The contracted employees would be at the:

- New Amsterdam Technical Institute;
- Linden Technical Institute;
- Carnegie School of Home Economics;
- Upper Corentyne Industrial Training Centre

Those are the main areas - teachers.

**Ms Amna Ally:** A Supplementary question - Could the Minister say in what capacity these contracted workers worked? Are they teachers?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Yes, most of them are lecturers on contract.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6117 - Temporary Employees - the Staffing Details illustrate that there is an increase from 157 to 470, could the Minister explain why this vast increase and specifically in what areas.

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** As you know the Fast Track Initiative - literacy education - we are employing a lot of part time people as literacy educators and we have so advertised in the national media across the country.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Account Code 6281 - Security Services - Could the Minister say whether all security services utilised by the Ministry of Education share an across-the-board rate as per hour?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** No, this is not so and we are rationalising the situation by calling in shortly all the security firms that are providing the services. We would be having discussions to rationalise the rates.

**Ms Amna Ally:** A supplementary question - Could the Minister say whether this disparity is great or if it is just something minimal?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** There are differentials and we have to see whether we will have to increase the rates also, because they have been standing there for several years. So we will be looking at this very carefully.

**Mrs Clarissa S Riehl:** Mr Chairman could the Honourable Minister answer under Account Code 6301 - Education Subventions and Grants - since Critchlow Labour College would not be one of those bodies receiving; could the Honourable Minister tell us what other institutions would get \$1, 039,109,000?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** They are:

- The Adult Education Association;
- The Guyana Association of Modern Language;
- The Caribbean Examination Council;

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

- Kuru Kuru Co-op College;
- President's College;
- Queens College;
- Guyana Industrial Training Centre;
- University of Guyana both Turkeyen and Berbice Campus;
- Linden Technical Institute; and
- Government Technical Institute.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, I wish to return to Account Code 6281 - Security Services - Could the Minister say whether the payment for VAT is inclusive in the billing for the security services?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Yes, and this is creating a problem for the sums voted last year, so VAT is included this year.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Mr Chairman, to revisit Account Code 6117 - Temporary Employees - Could the Honourable Minister say whether the temporary employees who will be attending to the literacy classes would be functioning in the normal hours of school or outside of those hours?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** They would be functioning outside of the normal school hours in the afternoons and on Saturdays.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** A follow-up question - Could the Honourable Minister say whether attendance for these sessions would be compulsory as a Ministry policy?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** There are three categories:

- The in-school category - yes, that would be compulsory for those low achievers;
- The out-of-school youths; and
- Adults.

So we have to encourage the out-of-school youths and the adults to attend, but the in-school student it would be compulsory.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Mr Chairman, could the Honourable Minister say whether any provision is made anywhere else with respect to the provision of meals or snacks to those children who will be compulsory required to attend school outside of the normal hours of school?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** No, it will require about one hour in the afternoons from three to four o'clock - no meals supplied.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** What about the Saturdays?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** The Saturdays will be mostly for the adults.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Agency 41 - Ministry of Education, Programme 415 - Education Delivery - \$3,942,280,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**The Chairman:** Page 446, 447 and 448

**AGENCY 41 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION - CAPITAL EXPENDITURE - Agency Totals**

Question is proposed that the sum of \$2,280,250,000 for Agency 41 - Ministry of Education Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - stands part of the Estimates.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Mr Chairman, I am focussing on Project Code 1205900 - Nursery, Primary and Secondary Schools - Could the Honourable Minister say whether he has an inventory, which is updated periodically where he is going to construct schools over time and would that have been the basis for determining the schools to be constructed in 2008?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Surely we are not operating by guess in the Ministry of Education. We do have a three-year plan for the construction, repairs and maintenance of schools through a school mapping exercise and so on. These are prioritised according to each. We do have that.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** If that is so, Mr Minister, then why in Project Profile 110 where this project is described, why do you in describing this project put at No. 2 -



## **BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

Construction of new schools based on needs assessment if you have such a profile with you and you know where the schools are; why didn't you list the schools here rather than put construction of new schools based on needs assessment?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** The Ministry did submit the list of the schools, but the format used by the Ministry of Finance might be different. We do have a list of the schools to come under this head.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Sir, this has nothing to do with the Ministry of Finance, I respectfully submit. This is a part of the description of project filled by the Ministry. Finance cannot put what you did not give them and don't you think it would have been better if only for satisfaction for transparency given you have all this information just as you identified completion of nursery schools at Albouystown, All Saints and so on, why didn't you put construction of the following new schools and name them?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Honourable Member, I reiterate, we have submitted a listing of schools and I have the names of those schools to the Ministry of Finance. It depends on their formatting.

**Mr Winston S Murray:** Which format? This is misleading. Anyway, I would not pursue this.

Could the Minister then make the list available to me, Sir?

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** I can give you some of the names right now if you wish.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Project Code 1205900 - Construction and Completion of Schools - Could the Honourable Minister say how much of the \$135,000,000 allocated is with respect of Bartica Male Dormitory reconstruction and could the Honourable Minister say why in like manner as in the construction of the dorm at Parika Salem CHS, could this not have been provided or under Region 7 budgetary allocations?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Yes, it is within the sum there to complete the dormitory at Bartica. Parika Salem would be under Region 3.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Just for clarity, could I restate the question please? I am asking how much of the sum of \$135,000,000 allocated is provided for the Bartica dorm reconstruction and is there a special reason why the provision for Bartica could not have been allocated through the Regional Budget as in the case with Parika Salem? Thank you

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** It is about \$9.5 million to complete; it is a roll over project and because of the emergency nature of that project it was deemed necessary that the Central Ministry move very quickly as you can see if you go to Bartica how far we have gone in completing that dormitory.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Ms Amna Ally:** Project Code 1205900 - Construction and Completion of Schools - the Profile indicate the sources, but could the Minister tell this Assembly what quantity will be spent on each?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** This would be supplied as the Honourable Member Mr Murray had requested. We will give you the figures.

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 120600 - President's College - In view of the dire need for furniture in all schools, could the Minister say what fraction of this amount would be spent on benches and desks for President's College?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** This will depend on the needs of the College and they will make their request based on the sums that has been approved. I am informed that it is \$5.5 million for furniture.

**Ms Amna Ally:** I was wondering Mr Minister whether the needs were determined.

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** Yes, the needs emanate from the school itself.

**Mr Mervyn Williams:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 1206300 - Critchlow Labour College - Could the Honourable Minister say whether that is a mistake or it is another digit missing before the zero?

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** It is not a mistake.

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**

**Ms Amna Ally:** Mr Chairman, Project Code 2604300 - Technical and Vocational Project - the Profile says ten regions, but specifically to the Minister identifies the schools and the PICs that will benefit.

**Hon Shaik KZ Baksh:** This will be for the design and construction of two new technical institutes, one in Region 3 and one in Region 5. Two new technical institutes have been established.

**Agency 41 - Ministry of Education - Capital Expenditure - Agency Totals - \$2,280,250,000 - agreed to and ordered to stand part of the Estimates**

**Assembly Resumed**

**The Speaker:** This brings us to the end of our business for today. We can start tomorrow at two o'clock.

The Honourable Minister of Trade, could you move the adjournment please?

**Hon Manzoor Nadir:** Mr Speaker, I move that the House stands adjourn until 2.00 pm tomorrow

**The Speaker:** The House is so adjourned. Thank you very much Honourable Members.

*Adjourned Accordingly at 18:40H*

**BUDGET ESTIMATES DAY I – 6 FEBRUARY 2008**